

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Reg. Reference: SD23A/0204 **Application Date:** 24-Aug-2023
Submission Type: New Application **Registration Date:** 24-Aug-2023

Correspondence Name and Address: Maceo Design & Management 81, Main Street,
Applewood Village, Swords, Co. Dublin

Proposed Development: Construction of a new all-weather pitch complete
with perimeter fencing and floodlights and all
associated site works.

Location: Tallaght Town AFC, Carolan Park, Ballmena Lane,
Kiltipper, Tallaght, Dublin 24

Applicant Name: Alan Merriman (Chairman)

Application Type: Permission

Description of Site and Surroundings:

Site Area: stated as 0.714 hectares.

Site Description:

The application site comprises a sports club with car parking, club house and grassed pitches on Ballymana Lane, to the south of Kiltipper Road. The site inclines downhill slightly from north to south. To the north of the site are 3 no. private dwellings. The surrounding area comprises other sports facilities, agricultural lands, and residential development, both rural and emerging urban in nature.

Proposal:

Permission is sought for the following:

- All weather pitch with perimeter fencing;
- Proposed flood lights; and
- Associated site works.

Zoning:

The site is subject to zoning objective 'RU' – *'To protect and improve rural amenity and to provide for the development of agriculture.'*

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Consultations:

Internal Consultees

Heritage Officer
Public Realm
Roads
Water Services

Refusal recommended.
Additional Information requested.
Additional Information requested.
No objection, subject to conditions.

External Consultees

Irish Water
Environmental Health Officer (EHO)

No objection, subject to conditions.
Additional Information requested.

Sensitivity Screening

The following overlap is indicated;

- Green Infrastructure - Assess within Wider GI Context
- Aviation Safeguarding - Bird Hazards – Casement, Conical Surface – Casement
- pNHA within 1km - Ref: 001209 Glenasmole Valley
- SAC within 1km of Site - Ref: 001209 Glenasmole Valley SAC
- National Land Cover Map 2018 – Hedgerows, Amenity Grassland, Treelines, Other Artificial Surfaces, Scrub

Submissions/Observations /Representations

Submission expiry date – **27th September 2023**.

5 no. submissions were received with objections to the current proposal, a summary of these concerns are outlined below;

- Additional vehicles causing damage to lane, inability to pass, no lighting or footpaths – expansion of the club causing traffic disturbances.
- Issue of pedestrian safety and traffic congestion.
- Concerns in regard to traffic and event management.
- Potential presence of carcinogenic substances in the proposed all-weather pitch that could cause a health risk if found in drinking water.
- Air pollution - increased emissions from more traffic
- Traffic gridlock and the impact for residents accessing Ballymana Lane.
- Emergency services compromised due to volume of traffic generate by the club.
- Impacts on existing hedgerows.
- Access onto Kiltipper Park would improve pedestrian safety.
- Concerns that previous application SD17A/0025 has not been implemented in full.
- Sightline from site poor, dangerous for users

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

- Flood lights will encourage later activity on darker nights increasing possibility of an accident.

Relevant Planning History

SD22A/0477 New all-weather pitch complete with perimeter fencing and floodlights and all associated site works. Decision: **REFUSE PERMISSION**

Reasons for Refusal;

- 1) *It is considered that the introduction of floodlighting in a darkened environment could negatively impact protected species, including bats, which are light averse, and the lighting could also impact the availability of prey. The applicant has not provided an AA Screening Report or any ecological and it has therefore not been possible to determine that the development will not have significant impacts on species at the site and in the wider area. A full assessment of the impact of the development on local ecology has not been possible due to the deficiencies in the information provided by the applicant. Given the ecological sensitivity of the site, to grant permission without adequate analysis of the potential environmental impacts would be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.*
- 2) *The site is located in an exposed area within the Athgoe and Saggart Hills Landscape Character Area (LCA) as per Appendix 9 of the Development Plan. Intensive floodlighting at this location would be visible from a distance and intrusive in the landscape. This could result in an impact to the setting of the LCA, which is deemed to have a medium/high sensitivity. Without a full landscape visual impact assessment, granting permission would be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.*

SD17A/0025 A new clubhouse, extension to existing car park and relocation of car park entrance, perimeter security fence and septic tank, including all associated landscaping and ground works. Decision: **Permission granted by SDCC and upheld by ABP following a third party appeal.**

Nearby Sites

SD12A/0077: New grass, all weather football pitch including associated boundary fencing, floodlighting and site works. **Permission granted;** relevant conditions include:

1. The use of the proposed 6 no. floodlights shall be restricted to between the hours of 8am and 10pm Monday to Sunday
Reason: In the interest of residential amenity and to ensure that effective control is maintained.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

2. (i) The light trespass of the permitted floodlights shall not exceed the limit of 5 lux during the permitted hours of operation of the floodlights, at the window level of the nearest dwelling located 20 metres to the north-east of the nearest floodlight within the application site.
(ii) The maximum permitted upward light ratio of the installation of the floodlights shall not exceed a sky glow upward light ratio of 2.5%
REASON: In the interest of residential amenity and to prevent a skyglow effect in this rural location at nighttime.
3. The level of illumination of the permitted floodlights shall be reviewable at any time by South Dublin County Council, and any changes to same shall be at the developer's own expense.
REASON: In the interests of traffic safety and visual amenity
4. The proposed floodlights shall be cowled and directed away from trees and hedgerows which act as ecological corridors for the feeding of bats.
REASON: In the interest of protecting bat habitats in the area.

Relevant Enforcement History

S9073 - Live Case, Nature of Problem: Erection of floodlights on the lands without planning permission.

Pre-Planning Consultation

In relation to the subject application, it is noted that a preplanning meeting (ref: **PP031/23**) was held on the 31st March 2023. The planning authority provided guidance without prejudice at this meeting and highlighted any likely concerns that would need to adequately be addressed in any subsequent application for permission. The notes from the meeting were issued to the applicant.

Relevant Policy in South Dublin County Council Development Plan 2022-2028

Chapter 3 Natural, Cultural and Built Heritage

Section 3.3.3 Designated Areas for Nature Protection and Conservation

Policy NCBH3: Natura 2000 Sites

Conserve and protect Natura 2000 sites and achieve and maintain favourable conservation status for habitats and species that are considered to be at risk through the protection of the Natura 2000 network from any plans or projects that are likely to have a significant effect on their coherence or integrity.

NCBH3 Objective 1: To prevent development and activities that would adversely affect the integrity of any Natura 2000 site located within or adjacent to the County and promote the favourable conservation status of the habitats and species integral to these sites.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Section 3.4.3 Landscapes

Policy NCBH14: Landscapes

Preserve and enhance the character of the County's landscapes, particularly areas that have been deemed to have a medium to high Landscape Value or medium to high Landscape Sensitivity and to ensure that landscape considerations are an important factor in the management of development.

NCBH14 Objective 1: To protect and enhance the unique landscape character of the County by ensuring that development retains, protects and, where necessary, enhances the appearance and character of the landscape, taking full cognisance of the Landscape Character Assessment of South Dublin County (2021).

NCBH14 Objective 2: To ensure that development is assessed against Landscape Character, Landscape Values and Landscape Sensitivity as identified in the Landscape Character Assessment for South Dublin County (2021) in accordance with Government guidance on Landscape Character Assessment and the National Landscape Strategy (2015-2025).

NCBH14 Objective 3: To ensure that development respects and reinforces the distinctiveness and uniqueness of the Landscape Character Types and retains important characteristics such as habitats, landform, vernacular heritage, and settlement patterns.

NCBH14 Objective 4: To require a Landscape / Visual Impact Assessment to accompany all planning applications for significant proposals, located within or adjacent to sensitive landscapes and to provide mitigation measures to address any likely negative impacts.

NCBH14 Objective 5: To protect skylines and ridgelines from development.

Chapter 4 Green Infrastructure

Section 4.1 Methodology

GII Objective 4: To require development to incorporate GI as an integral part of the design and layout concept for all development in the County including but not restricted to residential, commercial, and mixed use through the explicit identification of GI as part of a landscape plan, identifying environmental assets and including proposals which protect, manage, and enhance GI resources providing links to local and countywide GI networks.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Section 4.2.1 Biodiversity

GI2 Objective 1: To reduce fragmentation and enhance South Dublin County's GI network by strengthening ecological links between urban areas, Natura 2000 sites, proposed Natural Heritage Areas, parks and open spaces and the wider regional network by connecting all new developments into the wider GI Network

GI2 Objective 4: To integrate GI, and include areas to be managed for biodiversity, as an essential component of all new developments in accordance with the requirements set out in Chapter 12: Implementation and Monitoring and the policies and objectives of this chapter.

Section 4.2.2 Sustainable Water Management

GI4 Objective 1: To limit surface water run-off from new developments through the use of Sustainable Drainage Systems (SuDS) using surface water and nature-based solutions and ensure that SuDS is integrated into all new development in the County and designed in accordance with South Dublin County Council's Sustainable Drainage Explanatory Design and Evaluation Guide, 2022.

Section 8.6 Sports Facilities and Centres

Policy COS4: Sports Facilities and Centres

Ensure that all communities are supported by a range of sporting facilities that are fit for purpose, accessible and adaptable.

COS4 Objective 1: To promote the provision and management of high-quality, multi-functional, sport and recreational infrastructure across the County, in consultation with relevant stakeholders, to meet existing and future needs, to include sports hubs and multi-sport astro-pitches, in accordance with the South Dublin County Council Sports Pitch Strategy (2020), the National Sports Policy (2018-2027) and the aims of the South Dublin County Sports Partnership, consistent with RPO 9.15 of the RSES.

COS4 Objective 8: To support the provision of permanent space for well-established sports and recreational activities at appropriate locations within the County, aspiring to the standards and conditions met for such playing areas by National Governing Bodies, where feasible and in accordance with proper planning and sustainable development.

COS4 Objective 9: To support and facilitate a framework for the improvement, maintenance, and enhancement of existing community-based sports facilities within the County.

Section 11.2.1 Sustainable Urban Drainage Systems (SuDS)

Policy IE3: Surface Water and Groundwater

Manage surface water and protect and enhance ground and surface water quality to meet the requirements of the EU Water Framework Directive.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Section 11.7.3 Light

IE8 Objective 6: To ensure external lighting schemes minimise light spillage or pollution in the immediate surrounding environment and do not adversely impact on residential or visual amenity and biodiversity in the surrounding areas having regard to the Institute of Lighting Engineers' Guidance Notes for the Reduction of Light Pollution (UK). (see section 12.11.4 (iii)).

Chapter 12 Implementation and Monitoring

12.4.2 Green Infrastructure and Development Management

Relevant Government Guidelines

Project Ireland 2040 National Planning Framework, Government of Ireland (2018).

Regional, Spatial & Economic Strategy 2020-2032 (RSES), Eastern & Midlands Regional Assembly (2019)

Appropriate Assessment of Plans and Projects in Ireland – Guidance for Planning Authorities, Department of the Environment, Heritage, and Local Government, (2009).

OPR Practice Note PN01 Appropriate Assessment Screening for Development Management (March 2021)

The Planning System and Flood Risk Management Guidelines for Planning Authorities, Department of the Environment, Heritage, and Local Government and OPW (November 2009)

Assessment

The main issues for assessment concern the following:

- Zoning and Council Policy
- Overcoming previous refusal
- Use and Visual Amenity
- Ecology
- Roads
- Green Infrastructure
- Water Supply and Wastewater
- Infrastructure and Environmental Services
- Appropriate Assessment
- Environmental Impact Assessment

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Zoning and Policy

South Dublin County Development Plan 2022 - 2028

The site is subject to zoning objective 'RU' – *'To protect and improve rural amenity and to provide for the development of agriculture.'*

Recreational Facility and Sports Club / Facility are open for consideration under this zoning objective, per Table 12.16 of the County Development Plan (CDP).

Overcoming the previous refusal

To recap on the most recent preplanning consultation, which was held in March 2023, under ref: **PP031/23**. The planning authority outlined the previous reasons for refusal and what would need to be adequately addressed in a subsequent application. The points raised at the meeting that were issued to the applicant included;

- AA Screening required
 - Ecological surveys
 - Landscape character assessment
- Information on car parking – arrangements for access and car parking.
- Car parking spaces to be clarified.
- Would need to conform with sightlines and access details.
- Green infrastructure Plan
- Impact of the floodlighting
- Impacts to existing hedgerow

Previous reasons for refusal included (Application SD22A/0477);

1) It is considered that the introduction of floodlighting in a darkened environment could negatively impact protected species, including bats, which are light averse, and the lighting could also impact the availability of prey. The applicant has not provided an AA Screening Report or any ecological and it has therefore not been possible to determine that the development will not have significant impacts on species at the site and in the wider area. A full assessment of the impact of the development on local ecology has not been possible due to the deficiencies in the information provided by the applicant. Given the ecological sensitivity of the site, to grant permission without adequate analysis of the potential environmental impacts would be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

- 2) *The site is located in an exposed area within the Athgoe and Saggart Hills Landscape Character Area (LCA) as per Appendix 9 of the Development Plan. Intensive floodlighting at this location would be visible from a distance and intrusive in the landscape. This could result in an impact to the setting of the LCA, which is deemed to have a medium/high sensitivity. Without a full landscape visual impact assessment, granting permission would be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.*

It is noted that the applicant has submitted the AA screening report which was undertaken for the permitted application **SD17A/0025**, in August 2017. Considering the six years that have passed, and the AA screening is not site-specific to the current application, in addition to the site survey undertaken in 2017, and any preceding legislative amendments, the current AA screening submitted is not sufficient. In light of this, the applicant is requested to submit an up to date AA screening report, and is carried out by a qualified ecologist, the report shall screen out impact on all protected species. If the site cannot be screened out, a full Natura Impact Statement (NIS) is required. **Additional information** is required.

In addition, the second reason for refusal was in regard to the subject site's location and the impact on the Landscape Character Area (Athgoe and Saggart Hills). The supporting information does not appear to include a Landscape Visual Assessment. At this stage, it does not appear the previous reasons for refusal have adequately been addressed. This will be further assessed in the following sections of this report.

Residential and Visual Amenity

The application seeks to provide an Astro turf, approximately 7,700 sq.m, on an area of existing grassed training pitches towards the southern portion of the site. The pitch would be located proximate to the southwestern boundary, bordering a field in apparent agricultural use. The nearest residences to the proposed pitch would be approximately 225m west or 95m – 125m to the north, all located along Ballymana Lane.

A 2.6m metal fence would be constructed around the boundary of the pitch, with ball netting making a maximum boundary height of 5m. 6 no. floodlights are proposed, height 18m, along the sides of the pitch. The nearest floodlight to a residential dwelling would be approximately 95m.

The development of all-weather pitches and the improvement of sporting facilities is generally supported by the policies and objectives of the CDP. The site, however, is located in a sensitive area in terms of landscape.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

The site is located within the Athgoe and Saggart Hills Landscape Character Area (LCA) as per Appendix 9 of the Development Plan. This LCA is has medium/high sensitivity, meaning '*Few of the key characteristics of the landscape are vulnerable to change. The landscape is likely to be able to accommodate development with only minor change in character. Care is still needed to avoid adversely affecting key characteristics where they occur.*' Given the sites elevated position within the county, the impact of floodlighting is likely to be viewed outside the immediate area, impacting the overall impression of the foothills area. More information is therefore required in order to ascertain the wider views of the site, and how light pollution would impact the landscape and ecology. No information has been provided in this regard and would be required to adequately assess the proposal.

Ecology

In the previous refusal **SD22A/0477** there were significant concerns in regard to the lack of information provided in relation to the potential impacts of the development on biodiversity and the landscape. It is noted that the application site is in a darkened landscape at the edge of the Dublin Mountains, approximately 1km from the Glenasmole Valley SAC and 2km from the Wicklow Mountains SPA.

The Heritage Officer commented in the previous refusal **SD22A/0477** as follows:

Due to the considered negative effects on the ecological sensitivity of the area of the Dublin foothills and on the sensitive landscape value of this location, a refusal of the application for development is recommended, particularly for the application for flood lighting.

Should the application be considered for a request for Additional Information, I would recommend the following additional items of information be required so that a full and appropriate evaluation of the potential impact of the proposed development can be made:

- *An ecological survey is required of the proposed development site, particularly in relation to the hedgerow habitat and the use of the site and adjacent area by feeding/commuting bats. This assessment is to include an evaluation of the potential impact of the proposed lighting on the usage of the proposed development site and the surrounding landscape by local bat populations. The bat survey and lighting assessment is to be undertaken by a bat expert with knowledge and experience of the assessment of lighting effects on bats.*

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

- *The proposed development is to be assessed against Landscape Character, Landscape Values and Landscape Sensitivity as identified in the Landscape Character Assessment for South Dublin County (2021). These assessments are to evaluate and address the potential impact of the proposed extensive lighting on the high/moderate landscape sensitivity of the immediate area and in the wider landscape of the currently dark foothills of the Dublin Mountains.*

The Heritage Officer has reviewed the current application and supporting information submitted and strongly recommends that a **refusal** is warranted due to the site location, the proposed floodlighting, the unavoidable impact on a protected species under the EU Habitats Directive, and any grant would set an undesirable precedent for similar proposals in this sensitive location. An email response received by the Heritage Officer, outlined the following concerns;

I note that a Bat Survey has been provided this time with this new application, and the bat consultants have suggested a degree of proposed mitigation to reduce light impact around the carpark. I am still concerned however that the greater potential for impact from the proposed flood lighting in this location has not been addressed, i.e., the effect of flood lighting directly into the dark zone at the periphery of the Dublin Mountains.

Unfortunately, given the location of this application site, where there is no physical barrier sufficiently high enough or dense enough between the proposed flood lit pitch and the rural dark zone of the Dublin Mountains, I can't see a situation where there is unlikely to be an impact on protected species.

The intensity of the light associated with flood-lit pitches, and the frequency with which the lights will be used, can have significant impacts in a number of ways. While high intensity lighting prevents light sensitive species like bats from feeding or commuting through the area, it also has a wider effect of drawing insects away from neighbouring dark zones. This has the effect of reducing the number of insects in the dark zone that should be available for bats to feed upon. Recent studies into the effect of intense lighting on insects is also raising additional concerns. These studies suggest that insect reproduction and larval viability appears to be affected by intense lights, adding further pressure on food supplies not just for bats but for the wider ecological network.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

The location of the application site is unfortunate in that it is positioned at a height on a hill which faces directly into the darkened landscape of the Glenasmole Valley and the Dublin Mountains. There is little in the way of extensive or high hedgerows or trees around the application site to shield the dark zone from the impact of the proposed lighting. While there is already a nearby flood-lit pitch to the west of the application site, there is a patch of vegetation at that location which includes tall mature trees. Those can at least provide some screening.

There is little-to-no potential for effective screening at the application site, and waiting for hedgerows or newly-planted trees to grow significantly enough to provide that barrier would take too long a period of time to avoid impacts.

In other circumstances where flood lighting has been requested, restricting the use of the lights to particular hours over the winter period has been offered as a mitigation, namely because bats would have hibernated in winter and would therefore be unaffected by the lights. Unfortunately, with the changes that climate breakdown is bringing, winter weather is no longer guaranteed to be cold enough to ensure the required long periods of bat hibernation, and bats can be seen into December or as early as February/March. The additional pressure from intense lights at a time in winter when insect numbers are low, and the bats are particularly vulnerable could threaten survival rates of local bat populations.

*I would respectfully suggest therefore that in this instance, effective mitigation to prevent **impact on local protected species** is unlikely to be successful and that I would be recommending a refusal for the lighting element of this application.*

I appreciate the need to facilitate the provision of active amenity facilities to a section of the community, and I also recognise the conflict here yet again between the provision of amenity and the requirements for ecological protection. There are also other objectives outlined in the County Development Plan that relate to the protection of green corridors, landscape character, and wider public amenity provision in the Dublin Mountains that would refer here, and which I can collate and forward if you wish.

In light of the above, the planning authority considers that, given the nature of the development and the significant concerns raised by the Heritage Officer, the application should be **refused** permission.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Roads

The Roads Department have reviewed the application and provided the following comments;

Immediate concerns:

- *Visibility splay for existing entrance*
 - *Fencing panel obscuring view on RHS (when exiting) to be removed/adjusted*
 - *vegetation to be cut back and maintained*
 - *Car parking is not formalised; no Mobility Impaired spaces; no EV charging points*
 - *No bicycle parking provision; spaces must be covered and secure o Signing & road markings – STOP sign and STOP bar required at junction with Ballymana Lane*
 - *Construction traffic to and from the site*
 - *The import/export of material*

Access/Egress

Applicant to submit information detailing how minimum sightline distances can be achieved for traffic egressing the grounds, accompanied by a visibility splay drawing based on the current speed limit for Ballymana Lane.

Car parking

The carpark requires a formal layout – Dwg to be provided to include footpaths (min 2m wide).

Applicant to submit a revised layout showing a formalised carparking layout which includes a safe pedestrian corridor where:

- *5% of parking spaces shall be allocated for mobility impaired users*
- *20% of parking spaces shall be equipped with EV charging points.*

Reversing distance of 6m must be maintained behind all perpendicular parking.

Bicycle parking

- *Covered bicycle parking must be provided.*
- *Minimum rates to be in line with the CDP 2022-28, table 12.23 and as per 'National Cycle Manual' specification.*

Applicant to submit a revised layout showing a covered bicycle parking provision in line with the requirements of the CDP 2022-28, Table 12.23.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Emergency Vehicle & Refuse Vehicle Access

Applicant to submit a layout showing safe access and egress for emergency & refuse vehicles.

CTMP

Applicant to submit a Construction Traffic Management Plan.

CWDWMP

Applicant to submit a Construction Waste and Demolition Waste Management Plan to include:

- *Volumes to be transported.*
- *Haulage routes*
- *Number of trips generated.*
- *Times of generated trips*
- *Traffic Management*

Roads recommend that additional information be requested from the applicant:

- 1) *Applicant to submit information detailing how minimum sightline distances can be achieved for traffic egressing the grounds; accompanied by a visibility splay drawing derived using the current speed limit for Ballymana Lane which includes a stop sign and stop bar provision at the egress point.*
- 2) *Applicant to submit a revised layout showing a formalised carparking layout which includes a safe pedestrian corridor where:*
 - *5% of parking spaces shall be allocated for mobility impaired users.*
 - *20% of parking spaces shall be equipped with EV charging points Reversing distance of 6m must be maintained behind all perpendicular parking.*
- 3) *Applicant to submit a revised layout showing a covered bicycle parking provision in line with the requirements of the CDP 2022-28, Table 12.23.*
- 4) *Applicant to submit a layout showing safe access and egress for emergency & refuse vehicles.*
- 5) *Applicant to submit a Construction Traffic Management Plan.*

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

- 6) *Applicant to submit a Construction Waste and Demolition Waste Management Plan to include:*
- a) *Volumes to be transported.*
 - b) *Haulage routes*
 - c) *Number of trips generated.*
 - d) *Times of generated trips*
 - e) *Traffic Management*

Should the permission be granted, the following conditions are suggested:

- 1) *The boundary walls at vehicle access points shall be limited to a maximum height of 0.9m, and any boundary pillars shall be limited to a maximum height of 1.2m, in order to improve forward visibility for vehicles.*
- 2) *The vehicular access point shall not exceed a width of 4.2 meters.*
- 3) *Any gates shall open inwards and not outwards over the public domain.*

It is noted that a number of third-party submissions raised concerns in relation to the traffic impact of the proposed development. Having regard to these concerns, the Roads Department were consulted by phone (Graham Murphy) and have recommended that a Traffic and Transport Assessment (TTA), a Mobility Management Plan and an Event Management Plan are all carried out to assess and mitigate the impacts of the proposed development.

If the Heritage Officers recommendation was other than a refusal, then these roads issues could be requested as **additional information**.

Green Infrastructure

The subject site does not appear to be located within a Core Area, Primary GI Corridor or Secondary GI Link as identified in the Green Infrastructure Strategy Map (Figure 4.4 of the County Development Plan 2022 – 2028). The site is proximate to the Tallaght-Dublin Mountains Secondary GI Link and the Dodder River Primary GI Corridor, leading into a Core Area per Figure 4.4.

The development would replace existing grass pitches with an all-weather Astro pitch surrounded by a Paladin fence. There are concerns that this could impact surface water runoff from the site and would result in the loss of green infrastructure.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

The Public Realm section have reviewed the application and have recommended that **additional information** is requested, their report recommends the following is sought from the applicant:

1) Landscape Design Proposals

The applicant is requested to provide detailed landscape design for the proposed development including Landscape Design Statement/Rationale and detailed GI Plan. The applicant shall provide a fully detailed landscape plan with full works specification, that accords with the specifications and requirements of the Council's Public Realm Section. The applicant shall provide the following additional information:

- i. The applicant shall submit a comprehensive Landscape Design Rationale, the objective of this report is to describe the proposed landscape and external works as part of this proposed housing development.*
- ii. The applicant is requested to submit a fully detailed Planting Plan to accompany the landscape proposals for the entire development. The applicant should propose native species where possible to encourage biodiversity and support pollinators within the landscape.*
- iii. The applicant shall include only native species trees and shrubs will the landscape plan. Any proposed non-native species including proposed Ash (*Fraxinus excelsior*) shall be removed and replaced with native varieties.*
- iv. The landscape Plan shall include hard and soft landscape details; including levels, sections and elevations, detailed design of SUDs features including swales and integrated/bio-retention tree pits.*
- v. Significantly reduce the impacts of the development on existing green infrastructure within and adjacent to the proposed development site.*
- vi. Demonstrate how natural SUDs features can be incorporated into the design of the proposed Development.*
- vii. Submit green infrastructure proposals and a green infrastructure plan that will mitigate and compensate for the impact of the proposed development on this existing site and show connections to the wider GI Network. These proposals should include additional landscaping, SUDs measures (such as permeable paving, green roofs, filtration planting, above ground attenuation ponds etc) and planting for carbon sequestration and pollination to support the local Bat population.*

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

2) Tree and Hedgerow Survey

The applicant is requested to submit a comprehensive Tree Report. This Tree Report shall comprise of the following:

- i. a detailed Tree Survey,*
- ii. Arboricultural Impact Assessment,*
- iii. Tree Constraints Plan,*
- iv. Tree Protection Plan and*
- v. Arboricultural Method Statement*

All of the above shall be in accordance with BS 5837: 2012 Trees in relation to design, demolition, and construction - recommendations. The Tree Report shall be carried out by an independent and qualified Arborist.

3) Bat Assessment

The recommendations contained with the Bat Assessment shall be incorporated into the revised landscape layout and all recommendations shall be implemented in full.

4) Landscape and Visual Impact Assessment

The applicant has provided little or no information as to the landscape and visual impact of the proposed development. The applicant is requested to provide a detailed landscape and visual impact assessment including photo montages for the proposed development. The Visual Impact Assessment should identify key viewpoints to the site from the surrounding area, including CGI of existing views and views of the proposed development.

5) Detailed Lighting Assessment

The applicant is requested to submit a detailed lighting assessment for the proposed flood lighting. The Lighting assessment as a minimum should include the following information:

- i. a description of the proposed hours of operation, light spillage, light levels, and column heights*
- ii. a layout plan of the proposed development site showing beam orientation.*
- iii. details of the proposed equipment design*
- iv. details of the expected impact on neighbouring properties and roads*
- v. a statement of any proposed measures to mitigate or compensate for the possible impacts of the proposed development.*

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

6) Lighting design strategy (biodiversity)

The applicant is requested to submit a Detailed Lighting Design Strategy for Biodiversity for the proposed flood lighting associated with the new all-weather pitch. The strategy shall include the following information:

- a) identify the areas or features on the site that are particularly sensitive for bats and identify the aspects of the development that would be likely to cause disturbance in or around the breeding sites and resting places of bats or along important routes used to access key areas of their territory; and*
- b) show how and where all the proposed external lighting will be installed and demonstrate (through the provision of appropriate lighting contour plans and technical specifications) that those areas to be lit will not disturb or prevent the above species using their territory or gaining access to their breeding sites, resting places, and foraging areas.*

All external lighting shall be installed in accordance with the specifications and locations set out in the approved strategy, and no other external lighting shall be installed without prior express consent from the planning authority.

7) Sustainable Drainage Systems (SuDS)

The applicant shall submit a drawing in plan and cross-sectional views clearly showing proposed Sustainable Drainage Systems (SuDS) features for the development. In terms of SUDS the applicant is requested to provide the following information:

- i. A SuDS proposal that complies with SDCC SUDS Explanatory Design and Evaluation Guide 2022, and SDCC County Development Plan 2022-2028.*
- ii. The SuDS proposals should be a collaboration between landscape architect and the drainage engineer to integrate the SuDS into the landscape design proposals providing amenity, biodiversity, water quality treatment as well as quality and attenuation.*
- iii. Plans showing existing and proposed flows.*
- iv. Investigate the use of existing natural ditches and hedges as part of the overall SuDS proposal.*
- v. Details on how each SuDS component function as part of the overall treatment train.*
- vi. Demonstrate the biodiversity, amenity, water quality and attenuation value of all SuDS features.*
- vii. A comprehensive SUDS Management Plan shall be submitted to demonstrate that the proposed SUDS features have reduced the rate of run off into the existing surface water drainage network. A maintenance plan shall also be included as a demonstration of how the system will function following implementation.*

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

8) Green Infrastructure and Green Space Factor (GSF)

The applicant is requested to provide additional information as follows and in accordance with the quoted policies and sections of the South Dublin County Development Plan 2022 - 2028:

- a) *To demonstrate how they intend to reduce fragmentation of existing green infrastructure. The applicant should provide a green infrastructure plan showing connections through the site and connections to wider GI network.*
- b) *To demonstrate how the appropriate Greening Factor will be achieved for the relevant land use zoning objective. See link to the Green Space Factor Worksheet: Related Documents - SDCC*

As the development will result in the loss of green infrastructure assets which could impact the sites drainage and GI value, as well as the provision of floodlighting impacting on views and ecology, it is considered further assessments and responses are required by the applicant. The significance of documentation required is considered essential to form a final decision, therefore the items listed above are requested by way of **additional information**.

In the event additional information is not sought, the application should be **refused** on the basis of insufficient assessments provided.

Water Supply and Wastewater

Water Services have reviewed the application and concluded no objection subject to the recommended **conditions**. Irish Water have not returned a report at the time of writing, in any event, standard **conditions** will apply.

Infrastructure and Environmental Services

The Environmental Health Officer has reviewed the application and requested the following additional information;

Development Summary:

The applicant submitted a screening report and other assessments for development at the lands at Tallaght Athletic Football Club, Carolan Park, Ballymana Lane, Kiltipper, Dublin 24 which were reviewed by this department. These assessments do not include any evaluations regarding the impacts of flood lighting from glare and light spillage to residential properties.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Decision:

Additional Information must be submitted to adequately access this application. This includes the following:

- 1) *Floodlighting Impact Assessment. This must set out general definitions of light pollution, light spill, and glare. It must set out methods for general reduction of light pollution and details of proposed floodlighting installation to be incorporated at the football pitch. Calculation of impacts on surrounding properties shall also be included in the assessment.*

Reason: *To protect the residential amenities of the adjoining properties*

- 2) *The assessment must include proposals to negate intrusive light to neighbouring properties. The assessment must also be prepared in compliance with best guidance and represents best practice application of current technologies for obtrusive light control.*

Reason: *To prevent light pollution and the creation of a nuisance, in the interests of residential amenity and the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.*

It is noted that a floodlighting report prepared by Signify Commercial supports the application. However, the primary concerns are in relation to the impacts from the proposed floodlights on the local ecology and the nearby sensitive receptors. The lighting report submitted includes details and specifications of the lighting etc., however, it does not adequately assess the level of impact on sensitive receptors. The lack of information limits the planning authority's capacity, in regard to assessing the levels of likely impacts that would arise from the proposed flood lighting. Therefore, the items raised by the EHO in addition to the items included in the Public Realm Department's report are considered reasonable to request via **additional information**.

Screening for Appropriate Assessment

The applicant has submitted an AA screening dated August 2017. The AA screening was submitted with information supporting permitted development **SD17A/0025**. While the screening is out of date. Following discussions with the Heritage Officer, she considers the proposals would not be relevant to the qualifying interests of the European designated site Glenasmole Valley SAC or other European Sites and as such an NIS is not warranted.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Environmental Impact Assessment

Having regard to the nature of the proposed development, and the distance of the site from nearby sensitive receptors, there is no real likelihood of significant effects on the environment arising from the proposed development. The need for environmental impact assessment can, therefore, be excluded at preliminary examination and a screening determination is not required.

Conclusion

Having regard to the provisions of the South Dublin County Council Development Plan 2022-2028 and the assessment of relevant consultees, it is considered that the development would result in serious negative impacts to the bat population in the area and impact the landscape character. On this basis, the proposal is not considered to be in the interests of the proper planning and sustainable development of the area and should be **refused**.

Recommendation

I recommend that a decision to Refuse Permission be made under the Planning & Development Act, 2000 (as amended) for the reasons set out in the Schedule hereto:-

SCHEDULE

REASON(S)

1. The proposals and in particular the proposed floodlighting may have serious adverse effects on the bat population in the vicinity of the site and the Planning Authority notes bats are protected under the EU Habitats Directive. Although the submitted bat survey includes mitigation measures to reduce light impact around the car park, the submitted measures do not overcome the Planning Authority's concerns in this regard and these include the effect of flood lighting directly into a dark zone at the periphery of the Dublin Mountains. In addition, the proposed development would set an undesirable precedent for other similar developments in this sensitive area, which would in themselves and cumulatively, be harmful to bats and therefore contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.
2. The proposed development is located in the Athgoe and Saggart Hills landscape area, which has been designated under the South Dublin County Council Development Plan 2022 - 2028 following a Landscape Character Assessment of South Dublin County undertaken in 2021 as an area with a medium to high landscape value and sensitivity and a Landscape Capacity which is negligible to low; meaning that the key characteristics of the landscape are highly vulnerable to development and that development would result in a significant change in landscape character and should be avoided if possible. Any increase in development in this area would have a negative impact on both the landscape value and sensitivity of this area, and would therefore materially contravene the South Dublin

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

County Council Development Plan 2022 - 2028 Policy NCBH14: 'Preserve and enhance the character of the County's landscapes, particularly areas that have been deemed to have a medium to high Landscape Value or medium to high Landscape Sensitivity and to ensure that landscape considerations are an important factor in the management of development. Intensive floodlighting at this location would be visible from a significant distance and intrusive in the landscape, thus the proposed development would contravene the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/1249/23

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

REG. REF. SD23A/0204

LOCATION: Tallaght Town AFC, Carolan Park, Ballmena Lane, Kiltipper, Tallaght,
Dublin 24



Jim Johnston,
Senior Executive Planner

ORDER: A decision pursuant to Section 34(1) of the Planning & Development Act 2000 (as amended) to Refuse Permission for the above proposal for the reasons set out above is hereby made.

Date: 18/10/23



Gormla O'Corrain, Senior Planner

To whom the appropriate powers have been delegated by the order number DELG 13623 of the Chief Executive of South Dublin County Council*