

SOUTH DUBLIN COUNTY COUNCILS

ARCHITECTURAL CONSERVATION OFFICERS REPORT

RE: SD22A/0096 AI Muldowney's Pub, Main St, Rathcoole

Appraisal

Significant Additional Information has been received in relation to the above application following a requested for AI on a number of items.

Under Item 3 the following AI was requested by the undersigned;

The southern block is linked to the existing cottages to create two L-shaped plan block arrangements around two inner squares which form an urban edge to the western open space and church. It is felt at this area that some separation distance is required to the rear of the corner single-storey cottage allowing a variation of heights and sufficient setback. It is considered that having the 3-storey block directly onto the rear of the corner cottage allows the block to be imposing and completely dominate the single-storey cottages.

- Differing heights and some separation to delineate the Main Street buildings from the rear block onto the Church site is required to minimise the visual impact. It is noted that the height of Block A is in line with the height of the existing church, however the block form of the proposed residential units is larger in mass and scale thereby creating more visual impact. The existing Church building although located setback off Main Street still provides architectural interest and character within the village setting.
- The new development at this location needs to provide a greater level of architectural interest and character. The proposed blocks need to achieve a backdrop to add architectural quality and interest to the rear of the existing single-storey cottages and existing public house.

It is considered that more consideration needs to be given to the materials and finishes in order to address the above. The height of the blocks needs to show different and varying levels and setback to reflect the different building heights, roof levels/types and architectural character and materials of the existing building stock along Main Street and the village core.

- Block A should be re-designed to ensure the street frontage element is delivered along with achieved visual connection to Main Street at this location, therefore the design should provide variations in height, levels and roof profiles to reflect a typical streetscape which provides visual interest and variety in design/styles.
- Block B requires re-design/revisions to once again provide an overall design that will provide architectural interest as a backdrop to Main Street. Some reduction in height and set back will support a varied design. The use of colour and perhaps different materials would also assist in providing architectural merit and quality defining the architectural quality required within the Village, as part of creating new design and architectural character within the Architectural Conservation Area.

- It is considered that a Method Statement and Schedule of Works should be provided detailing conservation repair and upgrading of the existing single-storey cottages to ensure the external appearance and retention of original materials are delivered.

Response to AI Request Item 3

In response to the AI Request Item 3 an architectural impact assessment report and design statement has been submitted along with architectural drawings. The proposal has been revised to take account of the RFI in addressing the design concerns under Item 3. The revised proposal replaces the previously 2 block with 1 block. The height remains 3-story, but the block has been set back from the cottages and Main Street as a result of the redesign.

The revisions allow for a more sensitive design and sympathetic approach within the Architectural Conservation Area. It is stated in the response that the design of the proposed scheme has been the subject of a full analysis/feasibility study of the site and due consideration has been given to the surrounding existing structures within the immediate environs of the site and particularly in regard to the material choices that are present within Rathcoole Village/ACA. The form, materials and finishes now better reflects the established character of the area and allows for a more compatible development at this location.

As previously requested in the RFI the new development at this location needs to provide a greater level of architectural interest and character. The new proposed block needs to achieve a backdrop to add architectural quality and interest to the rear of the existing single-storey cottages and existing public house. It is considered that although the design has improved with the reduction of the development to one block with setback, variation is required which can be either delivered by providing variations in height, levels and roof profiles to reflect a typical streetscape which provides visual interest and variety in design/styles. Or the use of colour with varying palettes of materials would also assist in providing architectural merit and quality defining the architectural quality required within the Village, as part of creating new design and architectural character within the Architectural Conservation Area.

A method statement and schedule of works has now been provided which provides details on the proposed works for the cottages and how original materials will be recycled in the case of demolition for the construction phase.

Conclusion

Given the revised design which now provides a single block design and set back, it is considered that the amendments to the design submitted by way of additional information is more appropriate for the surrounding context of the subject site. The overall visual impact has been reduced and the proposed block sits more sensitively behind the existing cottages along Main Street and the adjacent Church site. It is considered that more can be done to provide a high-quality design which provides architectural interest and variation to the Architectural Conservation Area as part of the final design revisions and materials.

Based on the above assessment of the additional information submitted and the revised design, it is considered that the proposed development is acceptable with conditions attached.

Recommendation

It is recommended the following conditions be attached to any grant of permission;

- As previously requested in the RFI the new development at this location needs to provide a greater level of architectural interest and character. The new proposed block needs to

achieve a backdrop to add architectural quality and interest to the rear of the existing single-storey cottages and existing public house. It is considered that although the design has improved with the reduction of the development to one block and with setback, variation is required which can be either delivered by providing variations in height, levels and roof profiles to reflect a typical streetscape which provides visual interest and variety in design/styles. Or the use of colour with varying palettes of materials would also assist in providing architectural merit and defining the architectural quality required within the Village, as part of creating new design and architectural character within the Architectural Conservation Area.

- A Schedule of materials and finishes should be submitted for agreement and approval for the proposed development. Samples and images of the final palette of materials and finishes should be provided. This should be submitted prior to commencing development by way of confirming final material finishes and colours and should address the above item.

This should include full details on materials and finishes for all elements of the proposed development. It is considered that given the sites location within an Architectural Conservation Area it is extremely important that the overall materials and finishes should reflect this in providing a more sensitive development with minimal visual impact.

Reason: To ensure the proposed development is of high quality and reflects the overall design ethos detailed in the Design Rational (Additional Information submission) and to ensure high quality design and finish for new build within an ACA.

- The proposed works to the cottages should be carried out in accordance with the Method Statement and Schedule of Works submitted as part of the Additional Information request. Works shall adhere to best conservation practice and in accordance with policies in SDCC CDP 2022-2028 for sustainable development and climate change with regard to reducing waste and in accordance with the Life Cycle Report.
Reason: To ensure all works to the existing cottages adhere to best practice and to ensure the development is carried out in accordance with CDP policies for sustainable development and whole Life Cycle requirements.

Irenie McLoughlin
Architectural Conservation Officer

5th April 2023