

Michelle Dodrill

From: Planning - Registry
Subject: FW: SD22A/0467-Architectural Conservation Officers Report re Oak Lodge Clondalkin

Subject: SD22A/0467-Architectural Conservation Officers Report re Oak Lodge Clondalkin

SOUTH DUBLIN COUNTY COUNCILS
ARCHITECTURAL CONSERVATION OFFICERS REPORT
RE: SD22A/0467-OAK LODGE, NEW ROAD, CLONDLKIN

Record of Protected Structures

Oak Lodge is referred to in the Council's Record of Protected Structures - Schedule 2 of the South Dublin County Development Plan 2022-2028 under Map Ref. No. 156. Under Section 2 of the Planning and Development Act 2000, the term 'structure' means "*any building, structure, excavation, or other thing constructed or made on, in, or under any land, or any part of a structure so defined, (a) where the context so admits, includes the land on, in or under which the structure is situate, and (b) in relation to a protected structure or proposed protected structure, includes (i) the interior of the structure, (ii) the land lying within the curtilage of the structure, (iii) any other structures lying within that curtilage and their interiors, and (iv) all fixtures and features which form part of the interior or exterior of any structure or structures*". Therefore, the entire site is a protected structure, including all existing buildings on site including their exteriors, interiors, fixtures, and fittings. The Protection also extends to the lands of the site and as such come under the provisions of the Planning and Development Act 2000.

Appraisal

This is an application for a proposed new rear extension to the Protected Structure Oak Lodge (as detailed above) and the insertion of solar panels to the existing roof. Other works within the grounds of the property are proposed in relation to boundary treatments and entrances.

It should be noted that under a previous grant of permission Reg. Ref. SD21A/0530 demolition of the existing rear extension was provided as the existing rear extension had structural issues and was not considered to be of any particular merit being a later addition. Therefore, a proposed new extension was considered acceptable in principle as a replacement for the existing extension proposed for demolition. However, a number of items were raised in a request for RFI under SD21A/0530 in relation the proposed new extension "*It is proposed to construct a side extension with a pitched roof in the form of a bay with sliding sash window side lights over timber panels with French doors onto a new patio which will replace an existing uPVC side door and poor quality patio area. It is considered that this element is fussy in design and pastiche in trying to match the existing first floor bay window. It is considered that any such modest side extension should be simple in design and form and should allow for a contemporary addition at this location in contrast to original architectural features and design of the existing house, thereby clearly showing it as a modern intervention and addition to the existing house. It is therefore considered that this element should be redesigned and revised to address the above concern*". At the time the applicant decided to reconsider the extension and allow sufficient time for the necessary redesign and felt this could be better achieved under a new application just for the rear extension allowing the current planning application (SD21A/0530) to progress in obtaining permission for the conservation repair elements and demolition of the existing poor quality extension.

The current application has now been submitted for the following elements;

Alterations and associated repairs to the existing two storey corner extension to the rear, (north-east), of the house, including the provision of a new flat roof with a roof-light; Proposed new two storey flat roofed extension with roof-light(s) to the rear, (south-east) with associated alterations to the existing building & development as approved under Planning Application Ref. No. SD21B/0530 – Having assessed the design and overall impact of the proposed new extension on the original built fabric it is considered that the new extension has been achieved a more sensitive

approach and suitable design and is an improvement on the previous proposal submitted. The set back provided and the overall form and finishes allows the new proposed extension to be sensitive to the existing protected structure.

Proposed new site entrance, (piers, vehicular and pedestrian gates) from the back (east), of the property, onto Laurel Park – The boundary at this location is not an original boundary treatment and therefore allowing a new rear site entrance to include for vehicular and pedestrian use does not cause any major negative impact on the protected structure. The new entrance will not be visible from the front site of the protected structure and therefore there is no visual impact. It is considered that the proposals will allow the rear boundary of the site to be improved for a visual point of view.

New garden wall with associated gates – The construction of a new garden wall running from the south-western corner of the site to the south boundary wall parallel to the front boundary is proposed. The proposed works will involve the construction of the new garden wall which does not involve original fabric and is being justified with regard to providing adequate security and privacy to the property.

Proposed solar panels – The insertion of Solar panels was initially included under the previous application (SD21A/0530) and the following RFI was requested at the time as follows;

“It is also proposed to add photovoltaic panels which will be positioned facing into the centre valley. Additional details for the insertion of photovoltaic panels and the works involved to facilitate their use have not been provided.

It is considered that further information and specifications are required for this work, details should include;

- *Information on the panel loads and their effect on the existing roof.*
- *The effects of any increase in loading should be identified to ensure this impact is addressed with regard to safety structural issues and any direct impact to the original roof.*
- *Details and specifications should be included on how the panels will be mounted. Associated works and additional services/items etc should be included as part of the methodology for the insertion of the photovoltaic panels in order to identify and highlight any such works to facilitate their use on a Protected Structure.”*

The RFI was not addressed as the applicant no longer wanted the proposed solar panels to be included in the application.

The proposal is now included in the current application and details have been included in the Method Statement which has been included as part of the current planning application. It is proposed to insert new solar panels to the south facing section of the roof facing into the valley. This will provide an overall area of 2sqm approx. and will be mounted on small steel brackets that raise the panels above the line of the slates, this will maintain airflow over the slates. The installation will involve the use of bolts to fit the unit to the roof and the removal of one slate to allow for bringing pipes out through the roof. It is stated in the method statement that should additional support be needed under the solar panels it is likely to involve the insertion of some bracing between limited number of existing joists subject to the engineers specification and approval. The proposed solar panels will not be visible from outside the roof valley making their visual impact on the building minimal to negligible.

It is acknowledged that the applicant is introducing energy measures to the property by way of the insertion of solar panels, however it is not fully clear what additional energy efficiency works will also be included to ensure the existing building is energy efficient and sustainable. The installation of any renewable energy source should be seen as part of a ‘whole building approach’ to improve the energy efficiency of a building. Taking a whole building approach is a logical process which enables the best possible balance to be struck between saving energy and reducing carbon emissions, sustaining architectural significance, and maintaining a healthy building. The whole building approach involves creating an energy plan that takes into account all the factors relevant to a particular building and its context. It is considered that confirmation and details on the additional or proposed energy efficiency works should be provided in order to ascertain the whole building approach and overall energy efficiency plan.

The main concern in relation to the insertion of the solar panels is the weight bearing on the existing roof and the interventions to allow additional support. It is therefore considered that confirmation of such interventions on foot of an engineer’s report should be submitted. There are also growing concerns in relation to the use of solar panel tubes and fire safety therefore it is considered that the following details should be requested as RFI in order to obtain full details in relation to the insertion of solar panels.

- Information on the panel loads and their effect on the existing roof.
- The effects of any increase in loading should be identified to ensure this impact is addressed with regard to safety structural issues and any direct impact to the original roof.
- Details and specifications should be included on how the panels will be mounted. Associated works and additional services/items etc should be included as part of the methodology for the insertion of the photovoltaic panels in order to identify and highlight any such works to facilitate their use on a Protected Structure. Also ensuring the system will be correctly installed addressing both minimal impact approach to the original built fabric and also to address any possible fire safety issues.

Conclusion

It is considered that RFI is required in relation to the proposed solar panels. Although detail has been provided not enough information with regard to weight bearing loads and additional interventions which may be required as per engineers specification.

It is therefore considered that further information is required in order to full clarify details:

The main concern in relation to the insertion of the solar panels is the weight bearing on the existing roof and the interventions to allow additional support. It is therefore considered that confirmation of such interventions on foot of an engineer's report should be submitted. There are also growing concerns in relation to the use of solar panel tubes and fire safety therefore it is considered that the following details should be requested as RFI in order to obtain full details in relation to the insertion of solar panels.

- Information on the panel loads and their effect on the existing roof.
- The effects of any increase in loading should be identified to ensure this impact is addressed with regard to safety structural issues and any direct impact to the original roof.
- Details and specifications should be included on how the panels will be mounted. Associated works and additional services/items etc should be included as part of the methodology for the insertion of the photovoltaic panels in order to identify and highlight any such works to facilitate their use on a Protected Structure. Also ensuring the system will be correctly installed addressing both minimal impact approach to the original built fabric and also to address any possible fire safety issues.

It is acknowledged that the installation of any renewable energy source is positive however given the status and architectural significance of the site the insertion of solar panels needs to be given full consideration. It is not clear what additional energy efficiency works will also be included to ensure the existing building is energy efficient and sustainable, taking a whole building approach. The installation of any renewable energy source should be seen as part of a 'whole building approach' to improve the energy efficiency of a building. Taking a whole building approach is a logical process which enables the best possible balance to be struck between saving energy and reducing carbon emissions, sustaining architectural significance, and maintaining a healthy building. The whole building approach involves creating an energy plan that takes into account all the factors relevant to a particular building and its context. It is considered that confirmation and details on the additional or proposed energy efficiency works should be provided in order to ascertain the whole building approach and overall energy efficiency plan. Therefore, confirmation and details on what additional energy efficiency works are being undertaken as part of the work to the property in addressing other more local energy efficiency upgrades should be submitted as part of the RFI request.

Irenie McLoughlin
Architectural Conservation Officer

21st February 2023

Irenie McLoughlin | Architectural Conservation Officer
 Architectural Conservation Section
 Project Delivery
 South Dublin County Council

