

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0611/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Reg. Reference: SD16A/0446/EP **Application Date:** 21-Mar-2022
Submission Type: New Application **Registration Date:** 21-Mar-2022

Correspondence Name and Address: Patrick Waslh Lisduff, Claremorris, Co. Mayo, F12 K8VO

Proposed Development: 3 storey 6 apartment unit, 1 semi-detached unit and 1 detached unit including car and bicycle parking facilities, bins and landscaping with new entrance gate.

Location: Rear of J. Collins Butchers, Main Street, Lucan, Co. Dublin

Applicant Name: Harbour View Construction Ltd.

Application Type: Extension Of Duration Of Permission

Description of Site and Surroundings:

Site Area:

Stated as 0.18 ha.

Site Description

The site is located on the southern side of Main St, Lucan to the rear of *J Collins & Sons Butcher Shop*. The subject site comprises an informal car park with overgrown vegetation along the boundaries. The surrounding area is predominantly residential in character with the two storey terraced dwellings of Sarsfield Park backing on to the eastern and southern boundaries of the site and the residential development Gandon Court on the western boundary.

Proposal:

Proposal is **to extend the duration of permission for SD16B/0446**, which is a permitted development for the following:

Apartment unit, 1 semi-detached unit and 1 detached unit including car and bicycle parking facilities, bins and landscaping with new entrance gate.

Proposal for Extension of Duration of Permission:

The applicant is seeking a 5-year extension to August 2027

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0611/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Relevant Dates:

The final grant of permission for SD16B/0446 was 4th August 2017 and will expire on 4th August 2022. Under S.254A of the Act, 56 days of this period are to be disregarded in the calculation of its length, corresponding to the length of the pandemic emergency measures undertaken in 2020. This effectively extends the effective period of that permission to 29th September 2022.

The application for extension of duration was received on 21st March 2022. This is within the appropriate time period for lodging an application for extension of permission.

Zoning:

The subject site is subject to zoning objective 'VC' - *'To protect, improve and provide for the future development of Village Centres'* under the South Dublin County Council Development Plan 2016-2022. The site is also located within the Architectural Conservation Area (ACA) of Lucan Village and within the Zone of Archaeological Potential.

Relevant Planning History on Subject Site:

Subject Site

SD19A/0031 - Demolition of 2 sheds (86sq.m) and construction of 2 older persons apartment buildings comprising 20 dwellings; Block 1 is 3 storeys with penthouse, consisting of 8 apartment with external terraces (three 2-bed and five 1-bed; Block 2 is 3 storeys, consisting of 12 apartments with external terraces (twelve 1-bed; shared access road/footpath; bin store; 10 car parking spaces; 12 bicycle spaces and all associated site works. **SDCC Decision:** Refuse Permission. The decision was subject to a First Party Appeal to An Bord Pleanála. **ABP Decision:** Grant permission, subject to conditions.

SD17A/0399 - Internal alterations only to a previously consented 3 storey, 6 apartment building. Development of this site has been granted full planning permission (Ref. SD16A/0446). No alterations are proposed to the site layout or any external elevations. **SDCC Decision:** Grant Permission, subject to conditions.

Relevant Enforcement History:

None Found.

Legislation:

Terms

'The 2000 Act' means The Planning and Development Act 2000, as amended.

'The 2016 Act' means The Planning (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016, as amended.

'The 2018 Act' means the Planning and Development (Amendment) Act 2018.

'The 2021 Act' means the Planning and Development (Amendment) Act 2021.

'The Regulations' means The Planning and Development Regulations 2001, as amended.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0611/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Summary of Recent Changes to Legislation

Previously, the Planning Authority was able, under s.42(1)(a)(ii) of the 2000 Act, to grant extensions of duration of permission for developments which had not commenced, where it was satisfied that there were considerations of a commercial, economic or technical nature beyond the control of the applicant which substantially militated against either the commencement of development or the carrying out of substantial works pursuant to the planning permission.

Section 42(1)(a)(ii) was deleted from the 2000 Act by way of the commencement of S.28(1) of the 2016 Act. **This commencement took effect on 9th September 2021.** Therefore, extensions of permission under S.42(1) of the 2000 Act can only be granted under S.42(1)(a)(i), which lists as a requirement that works shall have commenced.

On the same day, S.7 of the 2021 Act was commenced which provided a new S.42B of the 2000 Act. Section 42B sets out a new section 41(1B) to temporarily appear in S.42 Section 41(1B) provides for extensions of permission to December 2023 and various criteria for making such extensions. One of these criteria is that works shall have commenced.

The date of commencement of works has not been provided by the applicant, nor can the planning authority find a date when a commencement notice was sought.

Detail of Current Legislation

The power to extend the duration of a planning permission is governed by Section 42 of the 2000 Act and by Articles 40–47 inclusive of the Regulations.

Section 42 of the 2000 Act has been amended and has effect as per the following legislation:

- s.28 of the Planning and Development (Amendment) Act 2010;
- s.5(7) of the Local Government Act 2014;
- s.28(2) of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act, 2016;
 - Itself amended by s.1 of the Planning and Development (Amendment) Act 2017.
- s.28(1) of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act, 2016;
 - Itself amended by s.57(1) the Planning and Development (Amendment) Act 2018.
 - All commenced in August 2021.
- S. 7 of the Planning and Development (Amendment) Act, 2021.
 - Also commenced in August 2021.

NB: Both s.28(1) of the 2016 Act (as amended by the 2018 Act) and s.7 of the 2021 Act amend provide for amendments to s42(4).

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0611/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Subsequently, until 31st December 2023, section 42 of the 2000 Act has effect as if it reads as follow (this includes a reading as described in s42B):

‘42.—

(1) On application to it in that behalf a planning authority shall, as regards a particular permission, extend the appropriate period by such additional period not exceeding 5 years as the authority considers requisite to enable the development to which the permission relates to be completed provided that each of the following requirements is complied with:

(a) (i) the authority is satisfied that—

(I) the development to which the permission relates was commenced before the expiration of the appropriate period sought to be extended,

(II) an environmental impact assessment or an appropriate assessment, or both of those assessments, was or were not required before the permission was granted,

(II) substantial works were carried out pursuant to the permission during that period, and

(III) the development will be completed within a reasonable time,

(b) the application is in accordance with such regulations under this Act as apply to it,

(c) any requirements of, or made under those regulations are complied with as regards the application, and

(d) the application is duly made prior to the end of the appropriate period.

(1A) (a) Notwithstanding anything to the contrary in subsection (1) or (4), a planning authority shall—

(i) as regards a particular permission in respect of a development that relates to 20 or more houses and in respect of which an environmental impact assessment or an appropriate assessment, or both of those assessments, were not required before the permission was granted, and

(ii) upon application being duly made to the authority setting out the reasons why the development cannot be reasonably completed within the appropriate period, further extend the appropriate period by such additional period not exceeding 5 years, or until 31 December 2021, whichever first occurs, **but the authority shall only so extend that period where the authority—**

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0611/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

- (I) **considers it requisite to enable the development to which the permission relates to be completed,**
- (II) is satisfied that the application is in accordance with such regulations under the Planning and Development Acts 2000 to 2016 as apply to the application,
- (III) is satisfied that any requirements of, or made under those regulations are complied with as regards the application,
- (IV) is satisfied that the development to which the permission relates was—
 - (A) **commenced, and**
 - (B) **substantial works were carried out,** before the expiration of the appropriate period or any extension of that period, and
- (V) is satisfied that in the case of a permission—
 - (A) where the expiry of the appropriate period as extended occurred or occurs during the period from 19 July 2016 to the day preceding the day that section 28(2) of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016 comes into operation, the application is duly made within 6 months of the said commencement date, or
 - (B) where the appropriate period as extended expires on or after the date of commencement of section 28(2) of the Planning and Development (Housing) and Residential Tenancies Act 2016, the application is duly made within the period prescribed for the purposes of section 43(2).
- (1B) Notwithstanding anything to the contrary in subsection (1), (1A) or (4) a planning authority shall—
 - (a) as regards a particular permission in respect of a development, and
 - (b) upon application being duly made to the authority setting out the reasons why the development cannot be reasonably completed within the appropriate period, further extend the appropriate period, as extended or further extended, by such additional period not exceeding 2 years or until 31 December 2023, whichever first occurs, but the authority shall only so extend that period where the authority—
 - (i) is satisfied that an environmental impact assessment or an appropriate assessment would not be required in relation to the proposed extension of the appropriate period,

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0611/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

- (ii) considers that the extension is required to enable the development to which the permission relates to be completed,
 - (iii) is satisfied that the application is in accordance with such regulations under the Planning and Development Acts 2000 to 2021 as apply to the application,
 - (iv) is satisfied that any requirements of, or made under, those regulations are complied with as regards the application,
 - (v) is satisfied that the development to which the permission relates was—
 - (I) commenced, and
 - (II) substantial works were carried out, before the expiration of the appropriate period, as extended or further extended, and
 - (vi) is satisfied that in the case of a permission—
 - (I) where the expiry of the appropriate period as extended or further extended occurred or occurs during the period beginning on 8 January 2021 and ending on the day before the date on which section 7 of the Planning and Development (Amendment) Act 2021 comes into operation, the application is duly made within 6 months of the date on which the said section 7 comes into operation, or
 - (II) where the appropriate period, as extended or further extended, expires on or after the date on which section 7 of the Planning and Development (Amendment) Act 2021 comes into operation, the application is duly made within the period prescribed for the purposes of section 43(2).’,
- (2) In extending the appropriate period under *subsection (1), (1A) or (1B)* a planning authority may attach conditions requiring the giving of adequate security for the satisfactory completion of the proposed development, and/or may add to or vary any conditions to which the permission is already subject under *section 34(4)(g)*.
- (3) (a) Where an application is duly made under this section to a planning authority and any requirements of, or made under, regulations under *section 43* are complied with as regards the application, the planning authority shall make its decision on the application as expeditiously as possible.
- (b) Without prejudice to the generality of *paragraph (a)*, it shall be the objective of the planning authority to ensure that it shall give notice of its decision on an application under this section within the period of 8 weeks beginning on—
- (i) in case all of the requirements referred to in *paragraph (a)* are complied with on or before the day of receipt by the planning authority of the application, that day, and

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0611/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

- (ii) in any other case, the day on which all of those requirements stand complied with.
- (4) A decision to extend the appropriate period of a permission shall be made not more than twice under this section and a planning authority shall not further extend the appropriate period. Where a second decision to extend an appropriate period is made under this section, the combined duration of the 2 extensions of the appropriate period shall not exceed 5 years.
- (5) Particulars of any application made to a planning authority under this section and of the decision of the planning authority in respect of the application shall be recorded on the relevant entry in the register.
- (6) Where a decision to extend is made under this section, *section 40* shall, in relation to the permission to which the decision relates, be construed and have effect, subject to, and in accordance with, the terms of the decision.
- (7) Notwithstanding *subsection (1)* or *(4)*, where a decision to extend an appropriate period has been made by a planning authority prior to the coming into operation of this section, the planning authority, where an application is made to it in that behalf prior to the expiration of the period by which the appropriate period was extended, may further extend the appropriate period provided that each of the following requirements is complied with—
- (i) an application is made in that behalf in accordance with regulations under *section 43*,
 - (ii) any requirements of, or made under, the regulations are complied with as regards the application, and
 - (iii) the authority is satisfied that the relevant development has not been completed due to circumstances beyond the control of the person carrying out the development.'

NB: Subsection (7) of Section 42 came into operation on 19th August 2010, as specified by S.I. No. 405/2010, which commenced s.28 of the Planning and Development (Amendment) Act, 2010.

Assessment:

Noting recent changes to the 2000 Act (see 'Summary of Recent Changes to Legislation' above), there are 3 subsections under which an extension of duration of permission can be granted. These are subsections (1), (1A) and (1B) of section 42 of the Act.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0611/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Subsection 1A applies to developments of 20 or more houses and does not apply to the subject application.

There are 4 criteria under subsection (1), listed under clause (a)(i). Criterion (III) requires that the Planning Authority must be satisfied that 'substantial works were carried out pursuant to the permission during that period'. The Applicant indicates in their Application Form that:

'The property was for sale and remains unsold presently'.

There are 6 criteria under subsection (1B), listed under clause (b) Criterion (v) requires that (I) works have commenced, and (II) substantial works were carried out prior to the expiration of permission. In relation to the subject application, as indicated by the applicant in their application form, works have not commenced.

Conclusion

The application was made after changes in the law which were commenced with immediate effect and became effective on 9th September 2021. These changes to the law have removed the statutory basis for an extension of duration of permission **where substantial works have not taken place**.

Noting recent changes to the 2000 Act (see 'Summary of Recent Changes to Legislation' above), there are 3 subsections under which an extension of duration of permission can be granted. These are subsections (1), (1A) and (1B) of section 42 of the Act.

Subsection 1A applies to developments of 20 or more houses and does not apply to the subject application.

There are 4 criteria under subsection (1), listed under clause (a)(i). Criterion (III) requires that the Planning Authority must be satisfied that 'substantial works were carried out pursuant to the permission during that period'. The applicant has to date not commenced development in relation to the subject application, as indicated by the applicant in their letter Application Form.

There are 6 criteria under subsection (1B), listed under clause (b) Criterion (v) requires that (I) works have commenced, and (II) substantial works were carried out prior to the expiration of permission. In relation to the subject application, as indicated by the applicant in their in their Application Form, no works have been carried out and a commencement date is unknown.

S.7 of the 2021 Act was commenced which provided a new S.42B of the 2000 Act. Section 42B sets out a new section 41(1B) to temporarily appear in S.42 Section 41(1B) provides for extensions of permission to December 2023 and various criteria for making such extensions. One of these criteria is that works shall have commenced, it has been established that works have not

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0611/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

commenced on the subject site, therefore the Planning Authority recommends a refusal on the request for an extension of duration of permission.

Recommendation

I recommend that a decision to Refuse Ext of Duration Of Permission be made under the Planning and Development Act 2000 (as amended), for the following reason(s):-

Reasons:

1. The criteria set down in Section 42 (1), (1A) and (1B) of the Planning and Development Act, 2000, as amended, are not met in this instance, and the Planning Authority therefore cannot grant permission for an extension of duration of permission. In each case the Planning and Development Act 2000 (as amended) sets out as necessary criteria that substantial works must have taken place.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0611/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

REG. REF. SD16A/0446/EP

LOCATION: Rear of J. Collins Butchers, Main Street, Lucan, Co. Dublin

Colm Harte
Colm Harte,
Senior Executive Planner

ORDER: A decision pursuant to Section 42 of the Planning and Development Act 2000 (as amended), for the application to extend the period for which the above mentioned planning permission has effect, is hereby made to refuse for the reason(s), as set out above.

Dated:

16/5/22

Eoin Burke
Eoin Burke, Senior Planner