

Michelle Dodrill

From: Planning - Registry
Subject: FW: SD22B/0082 - Architectural Conservation Officers Report re 657 Whitechurch Cottage, Whitechurch Road

From: Irenie McLoughlin <imcloughlin@SDUBLINCOCO.ie>
Sent: Monday 11 April 2022 17:23
To: Aoife O'Connor Massingham <aoconnormassingham@SDUBLINCOCO.ie>
Cc: Planning - Registry <pregistry@SDUBLINCOCO.ie>
Subject: SD22B/0082 - Architectural Conservation Officers Report re 657 Whitechurch Cottage, Whitechurch Road

**SOUTH DUBLIN COUNTY COUNCILS
ARCHITECTURAL CONSERVATION OFFICERS REPORT
RE: SD22B/0082-657 WHITECHURCH COTTAGE**

Dear Aoife,

Please see comments by way of a report in relation to the above planning application.

Appraisal

This is an application for the construction of a new two-storey extension to the side and rear of the existing dwelling at 657 Whitechurch Cottage. The application also includes for the demolition of existing single-storey extension and outbuilding to the rear and also the replacement of existing casement style windows to the front of the existing cottage with sash windows. The existing cottage is located in the Architectural Conservation Area (ACA) of Whitechurch Cottages. The existing pair of cottages (656 & 657) are part of a group of cottages known as Whitechurch Cottages which are made up of 2-storey cottages and single-storey cottages located along Whitechurch Road. They are an important group of dwellings designed by TJ Byrne and are considered to be of architectural and social interest.

The reinstatement of the correct window type to the front façade of the existing dwelling is welcomed. It is considered that the correct historical window type should be reinstated which match the original material, design and profile. It is noted that the original type windows timber casement at FF level and timber 2-over-2 sliding sash windows to GF level. The proposed two-storey side and rear extension is acceptable in principle. The side extension is set back and provides a smaller form addition to the side of the existing dwelling, however given its location which is highly visible along Whitechurch Road, therefore the overall design of the new addition has to be sensitive to the original cottage and be identifiable as a modern addition adding architectural interest.

It is considered that the proposed new extension has many different elements within the design which are not necessarily in keeping with the original style of the group of cottages and character of the ACA. Although it is advised that any new additions to the original cottages should be of contemporary and simple design the overall design and material finishes should reflect the existing cottages in order to provide a coherent piece. The new development Odins Way which is located on the adjoining site of No. 657 Whitechurch Cottage has used materials found in the ACA within the development.

The proposed side extension is shown with a dormer window to the front and rooflight. A dormer and ridge lights to the front of a roof slope is not in keeping with the roof form of the existing cottages within the ACA and therefore is not considered to be an inappropriate design feature. It is proposed to include sash windows in the new extension which although reflects the original type windows of the cottage it is not necessary within the new build. It is considered that the height of the side extension should be set-back but could follow the ridge height and roofline of the existing cottage. It is proposed to include a cantilevered bay at FF level and two-over-two sliding timber sash windows to the rear extension, which again are not in keeping with the architectural design and style of the original

cottages and would be considered to be pastiche. A porch is shown over the front door of the side extension which is fussy and does not reflect the design elements of the existing cottage.

The proposed side and rear extension will be brick finish to match the existing which is considered to be an appropriate finish as it reflects the FF finish of the existing cottages and allows the new build to be identified as a new addition. The scale, mass and form are deemed to be acceptable but once again the balance between form and overall design needs further consideration. In order to completely achieve a balance between the existing cottage and the new build it is considered that the fenestration and window type should reflect a more contemporary design and that proposed design features as mentioned above should be removed to lessen the overall visual impact of the new build and for it to be clearly identifiable as a modern addition which sits sensitively within the site context.

Recommendation

It is considered that the applicant should be requested to modify the design of the proposed side and rear extension and to remove some of the design features which are considered to not be in keeping within the Architectural Conservation Area of Whitechurch Road.

The following comments provided within the Councils Architectural Conservation Officers Appraisal should be considered when modifying the design, ensuring that the overall revised design provides a new addition which is sensitive at this location. As the principle of a two-storey side and rear extension is considered acceptable, it is felt that a modified design addressing the items detailed below should be requested as Additional Information.

1. It is considered that the proposed new extension has many different elements within the design which are not necessarily in keeping with the original style of the group of cottages and character of the ACA. It is advised that any new additions to the original cottages should be of contemporary and simple design the overall design and material finishes should reflect the existing cottages in order to provide a coherent piece.
2. The proposed side extension is shown with a dormer window to the front and ridge light. Dormers and ridge lights to the front of a roof slope are not in keeping with the roof form of the existing cottages within the ACA and therefore are not considered to be an appropriate design feature. It is proposed to include sash windows in the new extension which although reflects the original type windows of the cottage it is not necessary within the new build.

It is proposed to include an oriel window at FF level and two-over-two sliding timber sash windows to the rear extension. The oriel window would not be in keeping with the architectural design and style of the original cottages. The oriel window and the use of timber sash windows within the new build would be considered as pastiche. 3 modern large multi-pane steel frame double doors are proposed to the south-east extension which adds contrast and interest to the design, this principle should be followed throughout.

3. It is considered that the front dormer should be removed from the design and the ridge light should be justified at this location in order to assess their suitability at this location and more contemporary design features should be considered within a modified design. A porch is shown over the front door of the side extension adding unnecessary detail. The front elevation of the side extension should be kept simple and minimal in design allowing the materials and finishes to reflect the design elements of the existing cottage.
4. The proposed side and rear extension will be brick finish to match the existing which is considered to be an appropriate finish as it reflects the FF finish of the existing cottages and allows the new build to be identified as a new addition. However in order to completely achieve a balance between the existing cottage and the new build it is considered that the fenestration and window type should reflect a more contemporary design and that proposed design features as mentioned above should be removed to lessen the overall visual impact of the new build and for it to be clearly identifiable as a modern addition which sits sensitively within the site context.

Supportive and additional information is required in order that a full and proper assessment can be made on the revised and modified design thereby providing a new addition that adds architectural interest and quality to the existing dwelling and overall site context.

5. Details should be submitted verifying the correct historically appropriate type of window to be reinstated to the front facade of the existing cottage. Details on the design, profile and materials should be provided based on the correct historical type.

I trust the above is in order.

Kind regards,
Irenie

Irenie McLoughlin
Architectural Conservation Officer
South Dublin County Council



The Draft South Dublin County Development Plan 2022-2028