

Michelle Dodrill

From: Planning - Registry
Subject: FW: SD21A/0162AI - Architectural Conservation Officers Report re Brownsbarn, Citywest

From: Irenie McLoughlin <imcloughlin@SDUBLINCOCO.ie>
Sent: Thursday 24 March 2022 15:53
To: Caitlin O'Shea <coshea@SDUBLINCOCO.ie>
Cc: Planning - Registry <pregistry@SDUBLINCOCO.ie>
Subject: SD21A/0162AI - Architectural Conservation Officers Report re Brownsbarn, Citywest

ARCHITECTURAL CONSERVATION OFFICERS REPORT
RE: SD21A/0162 AI – BROWNSBARN, CITYWEST CAMPUS, DUBLIN 24 (OPP GARTER STABLES).

Appraisal

A request for Further Information was issued by the Planning Authority and under Item 2 the applicant was advised to liaise with the Councils Architectural Conservation Officer with regard to the potential impact of the proposed development in such close proximity to a Protected Structure (Garter Stables). The undersigned was contact directly by the conservation consultant engaged by the applicant.

The following detailed advice was provided as emailed on the 29th November 2021;

“The site is in close proximity to the adjacent site to the Protected Structure (Garter Stables). This building is a landmark structure along the Naas Road and any new building proposed within the adjacent site will have to be considerate of the existing protected structure and its setting. The views on approach along the Naas Road to Dublin are important as this is when a full sense and appreciation of the stable building is provided.

I note that revisions have been made as detailed, in providing a slightly reduced floor area and increased landscape area on the western side of the proposed units. The revisions are welcomed, however the units are still substantially large and therefore the visual impact on the adjacent protected structure is still apparent. There are no images showing how the new unit along the Naas Road on approach to Dublin will be viewed and I have concerns that the views of Garter Stables will be highly reduced and will cause an overall negative impact on the protected structure.

As they stand, the two units completely dominate and consume the stable building given their overall scale and mass. The overall design of the two units provides a massive block form which does not assist in reducing the visual impacts. I feel that very little effort has been made to reduce the visual impacts from a design view point and although the floor area has been slightly reduced and increased landscaping area provided, unfortunately is not enough to reduce the overall visual impacts and the sense of encroachment on the protected structure.

I would advise that more needs to be done looking at the design of the units, their placement within the site and how the mass and form of the new units can be reduced. The use of materials and how different design elements could be adapted to assist with reducing the scale of the new units i.e. finishes, colour, breaking up the elevations and height, set-back etc. should be looked at, along with the views of the protected structure on approach to Dublin along the Naas Road and the visual space and views from the protected structure in addressing the sense of encroachment, direct visual impacts and how the proposed units are currently dominating the entire site and the adjacent site of the Protected Structure”.

Assessment of Further Information Submission –

A response to RFI request Item 2 has been submitted. It should be noted that the proposed development has been subject to modifications to address the matters raised in the RFI. The modifications are shown on the plans and particulars submitted. Key changes have been made in order to address the visual impact and concerns that the proposed development initially submitted would result in negative visual impacts and a sense of encroachment on the Protected Structure.

The changes are detailed as follows; -

- The floor area of the proposed warehouse Unit 3 has been reduced to provide an increased landscape area along the western boundary.
- The alignment of the proposed warehouse Unit 2 has been rotated 90 degrees in order to provide a greater separation distance to the proximity of the Protected Structure (Garter Stables).
- The area of landscaping to the south has been augmented with a significant increase in planting.
- The ground level of Unit 2 has been reduced by 500mm which reduces the parapet level and will support the reduction of impact of the height of the structure relative to the adjacent Protected Structure.

It is considered that significant amendments have been made to the proposed Warehouse Units by way of reducing the direct visual impact and sense of encroachment on the existing Protected Structure. By rotating the Unit 2 a greater level of separation has now been achieved from the Protected Structure, thereby reducing the direct visual impact and impacts on existing views from Garter Stables and site lines on approach along the Naas Road. Photomontages have been provided in support of the revised changes and to show the proposed planting to assist with minimising the visual impacts of the proposed development.

Recommendation

Based on the above and assessment of the proposed modifications to the proposed development, it is considered that the proposed development is now considered acceptable, with the following conditions attached to any grant of permission:

1. It is considered that the proposed development should be carried out in accordance with the particulars and drawings submitted as per the RFI as revised proposals.
Reason: To ensure the amended proposal is carried out as indicated in the drawings and particulars submitted.
2. It is considered that a more suitable colour palette should be examined with regard to colours that would assist in minimising the landscape setting and visual impact, in particular the elevations viewed from the Protected Structure site. A Schedule of materials and finishes should be provided for the proposed new Warehouse Units taking into account the visual aspects. Details should be submitted prior to commencing development by way of confirming final material finishes and colours for agreement.
Reason: To ensure the final materials and colour palette achieves a coherent finish within the site context and adjacent to a Protected Structure Site in providing a suitable colour which can assist in continuing to minimise visual impacts.

I trust the above is in order.

Kind regards,
Irenie

Irenie McLoughlin
Architectural Conservation Officer
South Dublin County Council