

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Reg. Reference: SD22B/0020 **Application Date:** 20-Jan-2022

Submission Type: New Application **Registration Date:** 20-Jan-2022

Correspondence Name and Address: John Fleming Architects The Tree House, 17,
Richview Office Park, Clonskeagh, Dublin 14

Proposed Development: Extension to the rear and side of the existing house to be refurbished including an undercroft lower floor level below the new extension providing access to the lower rear garden; works to the house will include replacing the existing entrance with a window, a new bay window to the side (southwest) elevation, new vehicle entrance gate, driveway and parking area to the west of the existing house, leading to a new glazed entrance and hall way to the side (existing garden and gates in front of the cottage to be retained); the rear extensions will provide new living/dining/kitchen facilities with the extended and refurbished cottage providing room four bedrooms; the undercroft level will provide a garden level play room as well as storage areas; works include for all services on and under land including a new effluent treatment system and new dry stone rubble boundary walls along the existing road.

Location: Mount Carmel, Crookshane, Rathcoole, Co. Dublin

Applicant Name: Gareth McHale

Application Type: Permission

Description of Site and Surroundings

Site Area

Stated as 0.86ha

Site Description

The subject site is located approximately 1.5km to the southwest of Rathcoole village, on the northern edge of Rathcoole Hill Road within the townland of Crockshane. The site has a sloping topography, falling away from the road to the lands to the north. There are residential dwellings situated to the east and west, with the Rathcoole Hill Road running along the southern boundary.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

The subject site contains a single storey cottage dwelling with a hipped roof profile located in the southeastern corner and setback approximately 15m from the road and a single storey garage and outdoor toilet (24 sq m) to the rear of the cottage adjacent to the eastern boundary. The cottage is walled off from the remainder of the site which is comprised of a field containing a small cluster of outbuildings in the southwestern corner. There are 2 No. existing entrances to the subject site along the Rathcoole Hill Road, in the form of a vehicular entrance to the field and a vehicular entrance to the front of the cottage.

Proposal

Permission is sought for:

- Demolition of the existing single storey extension to the rear of the cottage (25 sq m), the existing single storey garage and outdoor toilet (24 sq m) and the existing collapsed shed and outbuildings.
- An extension to the rear and side of the existing single storey cottage comprised of:
 - Re-configuration of the layout of the existing cottage to provide 3 No. bedrooms (2 No. of which are ensuite) and a family bathroom, with a hallway providing access to the proposed extension to the rear. The removal of the existing principal front entrance to the dwelling and its replacement with a window in the same opening. The proposal also includes a new bay window to the west elevation of the existing cottage, with an approximate width of 2.5m and projecting approximately 1m out from the elevation.
 - A single storey extension projecting approximately 7.5m out from the rear elevation of the existing cottage, spanning an approximate width of 6.7m and rising to an approximate height of 5.3m above ground level. The extended area will provide a master ensuite bedroom and a linen store. The extended area includes 2 No. new windows to the eastern elevation and 2 No. new windows to the northern elevation.
 - A glazed link that connects the proposed single storey extension with the existing property. The glazed link has a width of approximately 4.5m and a length of approximately 7m and provides an entrance hallway with a new principal entrance for the dwelling in the western elevation, which also has glazing spanning the full width of the elevation. The glazed link also includes the stairway leading to the proposed new lower ground floor level.
 - A further extension to the rear of the dwelling projecting approximately 8.4m out from the rear of the glazed link and spanning an approximate width of 12.6mm, with

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

a 26.1 sq m green roof terrace adjacent to the western elevation and a 41.5 sq m terrace adjacent to the eastern elevation. The proposed rear extension provides a kitchen, living and dining room with a utility room. The extended area includes 1 No. new window to the southern elevation, 1 No. new window and an access door in the western elevation, an approximately 6m wide window and an approximately 4m wide window to the northern elevation and 2 No. access doors and 2 No. windows to the western elevation.

- A new lower ground floor level which is approximately 8.4m in depth and spans an approximate width of 20.6m. The lower ground floor level provides a childrens playroom at garden level, toilet, cellar, garden storeroom, boiler/pump room and storage areas. The northern elevation includes 1 No. window and 4 No. glazed access doors. No fenestration is proposed to the western and eastern elevations.
- Revisions to the access arrangements and boundary treatments as follows:
 - A new 4m wide vehicular entrance, in the approximate location of the existing field gate, with a solid timber automatic entrance gate set back 4m from the existing road edge.
 - New boundary treatment in the form of a new 1m dry stone rubble wall with a pedestrian gate in the approximate location of the existing vehicular entrance for the cottage.
 - A re-enforced gravel/tarmacadam driveway with a 1:20 slope, leading from the new vehicular entrance to the western elevation of the existing cottage, where 3 No. car parking spaces are provided.
- All ancillary site works above and below ground.

Zoning

The site is subject to zoning objective 'RU' – 'To protect and improve rural amenity and to provide for the development of agriculture' in the South Dublin County Development Plan 2016-2022.

Consultations

Drainage and Water Services Department: Additional Information required.

Irish Water: No report received at time of writing.

Roads Department: Refusal recommended.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Heritage Officer: No report received at time of writing.

Architectural Conservation Officer: Additional Information required.

Transport Infrastructure Ireland: No report received at time of writing.

An Taisce: Application should be assessed against Development Plan Policy and potential impact on visual amenity.

Screening for Strategic Environmental Assessment

Overlap indicated with the following relevant Strategic Environmental layers:

- Rural 2016
- Records of Monuments and Places 2016

Submissions/Observations /Representations

Last date for Submissions/Observations – 23rd February 2022.

None received.

Relevant Planning History

Subject Site

SD17A/0433

Two storey dormer house to rear and side of existing single storey cottage to be retained as part of the new dwelling; for new boundary walls, recessed entrance gate, driveway and car port, ground level terraces over lower ground floor at rear garden level and all associated work on and under land at 0.86 Hectare (2acre) site. **Decision: Permission Refused.**

Surrounding Context

No planning history of significance was recorded in the immediate vicinity of the subject site.

Relevant Enforcement History

None recorded for the subject site.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Pre-Planning Consultation

PP092/18

The following are the key points of the Pre-Planning Comments issued on 7th September 2018:

- Demonstrate how the previous reasons for refusal have been overcome.
- Any extension to the existing dwelling should demonstrate how it is subordinate visually.
- Demonstrate how the existing dwelling forms a fundamental part of the overall house.
- The use of any cut and fill is cautioned, having regard to Policy H27 Objective 1 and Policy H16 Objective 2 of the Development Plan.
- A detailed topographical survey of the subject site and the finished floor levels of the proposed development should be provided.
- Boundary treatment should retain hedgerows and re-enforce these with suitable native species.
- Surfaces should incorporate permeable paving and hard surfaces should be limited.
- A Design Statement should accompany the Application.
- High-quality materials and finishes that respond to the rural context will be required.
- Consideration should be given to the impact the proposal may have on the surrounding views and landscape.
- High-quality landscaping and tree planting should be incorporated into the design.
- A Landscape Plan, Planting Plan and appropriate Hedgerow/Tree Surveys should be provided.

Relevant Policy of South Dublin County Council Development Plan 2016-2022

South Dublin County Council Development Plan 2016-2022

Section 2.4.1 Residential Extensions

Section 2.5.0 Rural Housing

Policy H18 Residential Extensions

It is the policy of the Council to support the extension of existing dwellings subject to the protection of residential and visual amenities.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Policy H20 Management of Single Dwellings in Rural Areas It is the policy of the Council to restrict the spread of dwellings in the rural "RU", Dublin Mountain 'HA-DM', Liffey Valley 'HA-LV' and Dodder Valley 'HA-DV' zones and to focus such housing into existing settlements.

Policy H22 Rural Housing in RU Zone It is the policy of the Council that within areas designated with Zoning Objective 'RU' (to protect and improve rural amenity and to provide for the development of agriculture) new or replacement dwellings will only be permitted in exceptional circumstances.

Policy H27 Rural House and Extension Design It is policy of the Council to ensure that any new residential development in rural and high amenity areas, including houses and extensions are designed and sited to minimise visual impact on the character and visual setting of the surrounding landscape.

H27 Objective 1: Ensure that all new rural housing and extensions within areas designated with Zoning Objective 'RU' (to protect and improve Rural Amenity and to provide for the development of Agriculture), Zoning Objective 'HA-DM' (to protect and enhance the outstanding natural character of the Dublin Mountains Area), Zoning Objective 'HA-LV' (to protect and enhance the outstanding character and amenity of the Liffey Valley) and Zoning Objective 'HA-DV' (to protect and enhance the outstanding character and amenity of the Dodder Valley):

- Is designed and sited to minimise impact on the landscape including views and prospects of natural beauty or interest or on the amenities of places and features of natural beauty or interest including natural and built heritage features; and*
- Will not have a negative impact on the environment including flora, fauna, soil, water (including ground water) and human beings; and*
- Is designed and sited to minimise impact on the site's natural contours and natural drainage features; and - Retains and reinstates traditional roadside and field boundaries; and*
- Is designed and sited to circumvent the need for intrusive engineered solutions such as cut and filled platforms, embankments or retaining walls; and*
- Would comply with Code of Practice Wastewater Treatment Systems Serving Single Houses, EPA (2009) or other superseding standards; and*
- Would not create or exacerbate ribbon or haphazard forms of development.*

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Section 7.1.0 Water Supply & Wastewater

Policy IE1 Water & Wastewater Section

7.2.0 Surface Water & Groundwater

Policy IE2 Surface Water & Groundwater

Section 8.1.0 Green Infrastructure Network

Policy G2 Green Infrastructure Network

Section 9.1.0 Built Heritage and Architectural Conservation

Policy HCL 1- Overarching

Section 9.1.1 Archaeological Heritage

Policy HCL 2 Archaeological Heritage

Section 9.1.3 Architectural Conservation Areas

Policy HCL 4 Architectural Conservation Areas

Section 9.2.0 Landscapes

Policy HCL7 Landscapes

Section 9.2.1 Views and Prospects

Table 9.2: Prospects to be Preserved and Protected

Policy HCL8 Views and Prospects

Section 9.7.0 Sites of Geological Interest

Table 9.6 County Geological Sites for Protection

Policy HCL19 Geological Sites

Section 11.3.3 Additional Accommodation

Section 11.3.3 (i) Extensions

Section 11.3.4 Rural Housing

Section 11.3.4 (i) Housing Need

Section 11.3.4 (ii) Rural Housing Design

Section 11.3.4 (iii) Wastewater Treatment

Section 11.5.2 (iv) Development in Proximity to a Protected Structure

Section 11.6.1 (i) Flood Risk Assessment

Section 11.6.1 (ii) Surface Water

Section 11.6.1 (iii) Sustainable Urban Drainage System (SUDS)

Section 11.6.1 (iv) Groundwater

Section 11.6.1 (v) Rainwater Harvesting Section 11.6.1 (vi) Water Services Section 11.8.0

Environmental Assessment

Section 11.7.2 Energy Performance in New Buildings

Section 11.8.2 Appropriate Assessment

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

The South Dublin County Council House Extension Design Guide (2010)

The design of residential extensions should accord with the South Dublin County Council House Extension Design Guide (2010) or any superseding standards.

Elements of Good Extension Design:

- *'Respect the appearance and character of the house and local area;*
- *Provide comfortable internal space and useful outside space;*
- *Do not overlook, overshadow or have an overbearing affect on properties next door;*
- *Consider the type of extension that is appropriate and how to integrate it; and*
- *Incorporate energy efficient measures where possible'.*

Rear extensions:

- *Match or complement the style, materials and details of the main house unless there are good architectural reasons for doing otherwise.*
- *Match the shape and slope of the roof of the existing house, although flat-roofed single storey extensions may be acceptable if not prominent from a nearby public road or area.*
- *Make sure enough rear garden is retained.*
- *Do not create a higher ridge level than the roof of the main house.*

Side Extensions

- *Respect the style of the house and the amount of space available between it and the neighbouring property, for example:*
 - *if there is a large gap to the side of the house, and the style of house lends itself to it, a seamless extension may be appropriate;*
 - *if there is not much space to the side of the house and any extension is likely to be close to the boundary, an ancillary style of extension set back from the building line is more appropriate;*

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

- *if the house is detached or on a large site or in a prominent location such as the corner of a street, it may be appropriate to consider making a strong architectural statement with the extension.*
- *Match or complement the style, materials and details of the main house unless there are good architectural reasons for doing otherwise. Where the style and materials do not seamlessly match the main house, it is best to recess a side extension by at least 50cm to mark the change.*
- *Leave a gap of at least 1m between the extension and the side party boundary with the adjoining property to avoid creating a terraced effect. A larger gap may be required if that is typical between properties along the street.*
- *If no gap can be retained, try to recess side extensions back from the front building line of the main house by at least 50cm and have a lower roof eaves and ridge line to minimise the terracing effect. In the case of a first floor extension over an existing garage or car port that is flush with the building line of the main house, the first floor extension should be recessed by at least 50cm.*
- *Match the roof shape and slope of the existing house. In the case of houses with hipped roofs it can be particularly difficult to continue the ridge line and roof shape; however it is more visually pleasing to do so if this will not result in a terracing effect with the adjoining house.*
- *Where the extension is to the side of a house on a corner plot, it should be designed to take into account that it will be visible from the front and side. The use of blank elevations will be unacceptable and a privacy strip behind a low wall, hedge or railings should be provided along those sections of the extension that are close to the public pavement or road.*
- *Avoid creating a terraced effect and awkward join between the rooflines of two adjacent properties if building up to the party boundary.*
- *Do not include a flat roof to a prominent extension unless there is good design or an architectural reason for doing so.*
- *Do not incorporate blank gable walls where extensions face onto public footpaths and roads.*

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

- *The use of a 'false' roof to hide a flat roofed extension is rarely successful, particularly if visible from the side.*
- *Avoid locating unsightly pipework on side elevations that are visible from public view. Consider disguising or recessing the pipework if possible.*
- *Extending a hipped roof to the side to create a gabled end or half-hip will rarely be acceptable, particularly if the hipped roof is visually prominent and typical of other houses along the street.*
- *Avoid the use of prominent parapet walls to the top of side extensions*

Overbearing Impact

- *Locate extensions, particularly if higher than one storey, away from neighbouring property boundaries. As a rule of thumb, a separation distance of approximately 1m from a side boundary per 3m of height should be achieved.*
- *Use light coloured materials on elevations adjacent to neighbouring properties.*

Relevant Government Guidelines

Project Ireland 2040 National Planning Framework, Government of Ireland (2018).

Sustainable Urban Housing: Design Standards for New Apartments – Guidelines for Planning Authorities, Department of Housing, Planning and Local Government (2020).

Urban Design Manual, Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government, (2008).

Quality Housing for Sustainable Communities-Best Practice Guidelines, Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government (2007).

Appropriate Assessment of Plans and Projects in Ireland – Guidance for Planning Authorities, Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government, (2009).

OPR Practice Note PN01 Appropriate Assessment Screening for Development Management (March 2021)

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Planning Note

There are a number of inaccuracies and discrepancies in the information provided:

- **Application Form** – The Gross Floor Space of the Proposed Works and Demolition Works are not stated in response to Question No. 12.
- **Existing Drawings** – The Applicant has not provided floor plans, elevations and sections of the existing cottage at the subject site.
- **Section AA** – There appears to be a discrepancy in the floor level dimensions provided, as the same figure is quoted for the ground floor level and parapet level. Furthermore, the detail shown on Section AA does not appear to accurately reflect the layout shown in the proposed floor plan.
- **Boundary Treatments and Landscape Design** – It is noted that the drawings make reference to the retention of existing boundary treatments and the provision of new boundary treatments and entrance gates. However, no detailed drawings of the existing and proposed boundary treatments have been provided. To assist the Planning Authority, the Applicant should be requested to provide drawings of the boundary treatments, clearly identifying the existing and proposed and providing plan, elevational and sectional drawings. A detailed Landscape and Planting Plan should also be provided, outlining the proposed landscape design and detailing any planting which will mitigate the potential visual impact of the proposal from surrounding properties and the adjacent public road.
- **Roof Profile** – The Site & Roof Plan drawing appears to show a hipped roof profile to the proposed rear extensions with a flat roof profile to the glazed link. However, the Model View from South shown on the Floor Plans drawing appears to show a hipped roof profile to the glazed link and a flat roof to one of the rear extensions.
- **Site Characterisation Report and Site Suitability Report** – It is noted that the Overall Site Plan drawing makes reference to a Site Characterisation Report and a Site Suitability Report, however, no such reports appear to have been provided by the Applicant.

Whilst the above-outlined information is required to facilitate a complete assessment of the proposed development, an initial assessment is outlined in the forthcoming section.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Assessment

The main issues for assessment are:

- Zoning and Council policy;
- Rural Housing Policy;
- South Dublin House Extension Design Guide (2010);
- Visual impact and residential amenity;
- Heritage;
- Architectural Conservation;
- Drainage and Water Services;
- Roads and Traffic;
- Environmental impact assessment;
- Appropriate assessment.

Zoning and Council Policy

The subject site is designated with the zoning objective 'RU' in the South Dublin County Development Plan 2016-2022, for which the stated objective is *'to protect and improve rural amenity and to provide for the development of agriculture'*.

New residential extensions to existing dwellings are 'open for consideration' under this zoning objective, subject to their being in accordance with the relevant provisions of the South Dublin County Council House Extension Design Guide 2010 and the South Dublin County Development Plan 2016-2022, with specific reference to Section 11.3.3(i) which relates to extensions and the rural housing policy outlined in Sections 2.5.0 and 11.3.4.

The application is assessed below for its compliance with rural housing policy. If compliant with rural housing policy, the development can be considered to be 'open for consideration'. Such uses are assessed as follows under section 11.1.1 (ii) the Plan:

'Land uses that are listed as 'open for consideration' in the land use zoning tables may be acceptable to the Planning Authority subject to detailed assessment against the principles of proper planning and sustainable development, and the relevant policies, objectives and standards set out in this Plan.' "Proposed uses in this category will be subject to full assessment on their own merits and particularly in relation to their impact on the development of the County at a strategic and a local level. Such uses may only be permitted where they do not materially conflict with other aspects of the County Development Plan.'

An assessment of the proposed development having regard to the relevant policies and objectives of the Development Plan and House Extension Design Guide is outlined in the forthcoming sections.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Overcoming Previous Reasons for Refusal

It is noted that permission was refused at the subject site under SD17A/0433 for a part 2 No. to 3 No. storey house to the rear and side of the existing single storey cottage. The following reasons for refusal were cited:

The proposed development of this Planning Application is for an extension to the existing cottage as opposed to the two storey dormer house refused permission under SD17A/0433. In this regard the proposal is assessed as a house extension and not a replacement dwelling. Therefore, the Planning Authority considers that Refusal Reason Nos. 1 and 2 have been overcome. However, it is noted that the proposed development of this Planning Application will be assessed on its own merits, having regard to the policies, objectives and guidance contained within the South Dublin County Development Plan 2016-2022 and the South Dublin House Extension Design Guide (2010). This assessment will be outlined further throughout this Report.

In relation to Refusal Reason No. 3, the Planning Authority broadly welcomes that the proposed development of this Planning Application is for an extension to an existing dwelling as opposed to the part 2 No. to 3 No. storey dwelling refused permission under SD17A/0433. However, the proposal of this Planning Application will be assessed on its own merits having regard to the zoning objective and the relevant rural housing policy contained within the South Dublin County Development Plan 2016-2022. This assessment is outlined further throughout this Report.

The Roads Department have provided a Report in relation to the proposed development of this Planning Application. It is noted that concerns remain regarding the potential traffic hazard caused by the proposal. As such it is considered that Refusal Reason No. 4 has not been overcome. However, the Planning Authority is satisfied that this can be addressed by way of a request for ADDITIONAL INFORMATION. This will be outlined further in the 'Roads and Traffic' Section of this Report.

It is noted that the Applicant has not provided detailed information in relation to the wastewater disposal for the proposed development. As such, it is considered that Refusal Reason No. 5 has not been overcome in the design of the proposed development of this Planning Application, however the Planning Authority is satisfied that this can be addressed by way of ADDITIONAL INFORMATION.

Rural Housing Policy

The following Rural Housing policies and objectives from the South Dublin County Development Plan 2016-2022 are of relevance to the proposed development:

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Policy H27 Rural House and Extension Design

Policy H27 Rural House and Extension Design states that:

'It is policy of the Council to ensure that any new residential development in rural and high amenity areas, including houses and extensions are designed and sited to minimise visual impact on the character and visual setting of the surrounding landscape'.

The Planning Authority is generally satisfied that the siting and layout of the proposed development will ensure there is no significant visual impact on the character and visual setting of the surrounding landscape. However, as noted by the Architectural Conservation Officer it is important visually that the original form of the dwelling as a three bay cottage with central door is retained. In this regard, the proposal to remove the front door and replace it with a window and also to add a side bay window and relocated the front door as part of the proposed development should be reconsidered and redesigned taking into account the above concerns. This can be achieved by way of ADDITIONAL INFORMATION.

H27 Objective 1

H27 objective 1 of the Development Plan outlines the objective that:

'Ensure that all new rural housing and extensions within areas designated with Zoning Objective 'RU' (to protect and improve Rural Amenity and to provide for the development of Agriculture), Zoning Objective 'HA-DM' (to protect and enhance the outstanding natural character of the Dublin Mountains Area), Zoning Objective 'HA-LV' (to protect and enhance the outstanding character and amenity of the Liffey Valley) and Zoning Objective 'HA-DV' (to protect and enhance the outstanding character and amenity of the Dodder Valley):

- Is designed and sited to minimise impact on the landscape including views and prospects of natural beauty or interest or on the amenities of places and features of natural beauty or interest including natural and built heritage features; and*
- Will not have a negative impact on the environment including flora, fauna, soil, water (including ground water) and human beings; and*
- Is designed and sited to minimise impact on the site's natural contours and natural drainage features; and - Retains and reinstates traditional roadside and field boundaries; and*
- Is designed and sited to circumvent the need for intrusive engineered solutions such as cut and filled platforms, embankments or retaining walls; and*

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

- *Would comply with Code of Practice Wastewater Treatment Systems Serving Single Houses, EPA (2009) or other superseding standards; and*
- *Would not create or exacerbate ribbon or haphazard forms of development.*

Whilst in general the proposal adheres to H27 Objective 1 of the Development Plan, it is noted that, owing to the contours of the site, a significant amount of cut and fill will be required to facilitate the proposed rear extension, particularly the lower ground floor level. The Planning Authority acknowledges that the proposed lower ground floor uses the contours of the site to minimise the potential visual impact of the proposed development. However, the Applicant has not provided sufficient detail on the level of cut and fill required and that the proposal will not impact the natural drainage features of the site. In this regard, a detailed Drainage Infrastructure Design Report and accompanying drawings should be provided. The Planning Authority is satisfied that this can be provided by way of ADDITIONAL INFORMATION.

Policy HCL5 Objective 2

Although the existing cottage is not a protected structure, it is considered to be of architectural and historical value. As such, any proposal should adhere to Policy HCL5 Objective 2:

'To ensure that the redevelopment of older buildings, including extensions and renovation works do not compromise or erode the architectural interest, character or visual setting of such buildings including surrounding housing estates or streetscapes'.

Having regard to HCL5 Objective 2, the Architectural Conservation Officer has advised that the design of the subject scheme should be revised to set back to south elevation of the new side extension and provide a defined link between the proposal and existing dwelling, retaining the main entrance in the front elevation. The concerns of the Architectural Conservation Officer are outlined further throughout this Report. It is considered that they can be addressed by way of ADDITIONAL INFORMATION.

Section 11.3.4(ii) Rural Housing Design

In relation to Rural Housing Design Section 11.3.4(ii) of the Development Plan states that:

- *'A comprehensive site analysis and character appraisal should be submitted with all applications for houses and extensions in rural and high amenity zones (see also Section 11.5.5 (i) Ecological Protection and (ii) High Amenity and Sensitive Landscapes). The analysis and appraisal should provide a rationale for the design and siting of the proposed development including form, building finishes, height, and massing based on the local and natural context. Such development should generally be low rise. The shape and form of*

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

residential development in rural and high amenity areas, including roof structures, should be compact and simple with external building finishes that reflect the local character of the area including vernacular buildings and traditional building materials. Dormer extensions should be minimised and should not obscure the main features of a roof.

As previously noted, reference is made in the drawings to the provision of a Site Characterisation and Suitability Report, however no such report has been provided by the Applicant. The Planning Authority is satisfied that this can be requested by way of ADDITIONAL INFORMATION.

- *A minimum road frontage of 60 metres should be provided for all new dwelling sites in rural areas and a proliferation of housing along stretches of road in a manner that creates ribbon development should be avoided.*

It is noted that the subject site has a road frontage of approximately 53.5m. However, considering the proposal is for an extension to an existing dwelling, as such the minimum 60m requirement does not apply and the Planning Authority is satisfied that the proposal does not amount to ribbon development.

- *Dwellings and extensions should not be located on a ridgeline or in an elevated position in the landscape. The natural slope and landcover of sites should be retained, with an appropriate tree and hedgerow planting scheme that utilises and augments indigenous planting. Traditional field and roadside boundaries, including old stone boundary walls and hedgerows, should be retained or reinstated as much as possible. Sustainable Urban Drainage measures should also be incorporated.*

Whilst the proposed extension is located in an elevated position within the landscape, it is acknowledged that the proposal does not exceed the height of the existing dwellings. No Landscape Plan or Planting Plan has been provided by the Applicant. It is considered that the proposal could be screened from the surrounding area through the retention of existing tree cover and enhancement through planting. The Applicant should be requested to provide a Landscape Plan and Planting Plan by way of ADDITIONAL INFORMATION.

- *Driveway and parking areas should be minimised and should follow the natural slope and contours of the site with appropriate permeable materials. Modern gateways, piers and boundary walls should be avoided with the exception of the retention and reinstatement of traditional stone boundary walls'.*

The proposed development includes the provision of a new vehicular entrance and substantial hardstanding in the form of a new driveway. Having regard to the content of Section 11.3.4(ii), the Applicant should be requested to re-design the proposed Site Layout to utilise the existing vehicular

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

entrance with a straight driveway arrangement and the removal of the extensive 'S' shaped driveway, to be replaced with additional grass and/or tree planting to enhance the visual appearance of the site from the adjacent public road.

The South Dublin County Council House Extension Design Guide (2010)

Having regard to the content of the South Dublin House Extension Design Guide (2010), the following points are noted in relation to the proposed development:

- The proposal generally respects the appearance and character of the existing dwelling and the local area.
- Having regard to the scale and siting of the proposal and the distances to the boundaries, it is considered that the proposal is unlikely to result in overlooking, overshadowing and overbearing to adjacent properties.
- There are no drawings showing the plans, elevations and sections of the existing cottage and details of the existing materiality. In order to show that any new build reflects the material type and form in ensuring a cohesive addition a full set of existing drawings is required. This can be requested by way of ADDITIONAL INFORMATION.
- The proposed roof profile generally matches the shape and slope of the existing dwelling, however as noted above clarification is required regarding the discrepancy between the Site & Roof Plan and the Model View.
- The ridge level of the proposed extension sites below that of the main house.
- Sufficient rear garden is retained for the proposal, which will result in a 4 No. bedroom dwelling.
- The proposed extension has been located a sufficient distance from boundaries with adjoining properties to ensure there is unlikely to be an overbearing impact.

The Planning Authority notes that the proposed domestic extension generally complies with the content of the South Dublin County Council House Extension Design Guide (2010).

Visual Impact and Residential Amenity

Although the proposed extension will significantly increase the gross floor area of the existing dwelling, the Planning Authority is generally satisfied that it will not have a significant impact on the residential amenity of adjacent properties and will not detract from the visual appearance and character of the surrounding receiving context.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

However, it is considered that the design of the proposed development should be revised to ensure that the main features of the existing dwelling are retained (e.g. the main entrance in the front elevation) and that the southern elevation of the proposed extension is set back to further reduce the visual impact of the proposal.

In addition to the above, a detailed Landscape and Planting Plan should be requested from the Applicant to ensure that the potential visual impact of the proposal is further mitigated. Concerns also arise in relation to the visual impact of the proposed vehicular entrance and driveway.

The Planning Authority is satisfied that the concerns regarding the impact on visual and residential amenity can be addressed by way of ADDITIONAL INFORMATION.

Architectural Conservation Officer

The Architectural Conservation Officer provided a Report in relation to the proposed development, which indicates the following ADDITIONAL INFORMATION is required to facilitate a complete assessment:

- *There are concerns with the lack of detail on the existing cottage.*
- *The existing timber sash windows should be retained and repaired/upgraded appropriately.*
- *The render finish of the cottage is roughcast render and this should be followed through where the new build elements are visible from front site.*
- *Any new addition should reflect the form, simple vernacular style and material type of the existing cottage ensuring a cohesive addition. A design rationale should be provided in response site context of the proposed development.*
- *A revised design should be considered to address the following:*
 - *The proposal to remove the front door and to add a side bay window and relocated the front door as part of the proposed development should be reconsidered and redesigned taking account of the above issues. Mount Carmel cottage is the only historic cottage along this the Rathcoole Hill Road as the majority of the development in this location are one-off new builds and although it is not protected it is considered to be of architectural and historical value and any proposals should be looked at in accordance with the SDCC CDP (2016-2022) policies HCL 5 Objective 1 & 2.*

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

- *It is considered that the south elevation of the new side extension should be set back and how it then becomes connected to the existing cottage should be looked at in providing a defined link allowing a connection/entrance at this point while retaining the front door of the original house albeit not in use as the main entrance. Setting back the new side extension will allow it to be more sensitive to the existing cottage. Fenestration at the south elevation (side elevation) should be vertical and should reflect the original fenestration but in contemporary way. This elevation should be broken up with cladding or materials to improve its appearance from the front site and road side'.*

The Report of the Architectural Conservation Officer concludes as follows:

'It is felt that there needs to be a balance between the original cottage and the proposed extension in providing a simple contemporary addition that is sensitive to the rural setting and the setting of the existing cottage along Rathcoole Hill Road. This should inform the necessary revisions to the proposed new extension.

The Planning Authority is satisfied that the concerns of the Architectural Conservation Officer can be addressed by way of a request for ADDITIONAL INFORMATION.

Drainage and Water Services

The Drainage and Water Services Department have assessed the proposed development and indicated that the following ADDITIONAL INFORMATION is required to facilitate a complete assessment:

- The applicant has not submitted surface water drainage plans for the proposed development. The applicant is required to submit a drawing showing existing and proposed surface water drainage layouts up to and including the point of connection to the public surface water sewer. The drawing shall include the location of all Aj's, manholes, pipe size, material type and direction of flow. The drawing shall clearly show that the foul and surface water systems are discharging to separate pipe networks. Maps of the mains foul and surface water drainage networks may be obtained, if available, for required locations in South Dublin County Council by emailing: servicemaps@sdublincoco.ie. All works are to comply with the Greater Dublin Regional Code of Practice for Drainage Works.
- The applicant shall submit a drawing showing plan and cross sectional views of proposed SuDS (Sustainable Drainage Systems) features for the development

No report was received from Irish Water at the time of writing this Planning Report. However, should the Planning Authority be minded to Grant Permission for the proposed development,

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

standard conditions should be attached requiring adherence to the standards, codes and practices of Irish Water in relation to water and wastewater infrastructure.

Although no report was sought from the HSE Environmental Health Officer, it is noted that the Drainage and Water Services Department indicated that the opinion of the EHO should be sought in relation to water and foul drainage. The Planning Authority is satisfied that this can be achieved by way of a request for ADDITIONAL INFORMATION.

Roads and Traffic

The Roads Department have provided a Report in relation to the proposed development which notes:

'This area is saturated with one off houses on a substandard rural road network which is inadequate in width and which has no footpaths, public lighting, drainage and has poor horizontal/vertical alignment. The road immediately to the front of the subject site is only wide enough for one vehicle'.

The Roads Department have recommended that permission be REFUSED for the proposed development, citing the following reasons:

- *'The proposed development would be located on a substandard rural road network which is narrow in width, has poor vertical and horizontal alignment and lacks pedestrian footpaths, public lighting and drainage facilities. The generation of additional traffic/turning movements on this substandard rural road would endanger public safety by reason of a traffic hazard.*
- *This proposal constitutes undesirable ribbon development on a substandard rural road network, which will lead to a demand for the uneconomic provision of services and would set an undesirable precedent for further similar developments in the area'.*

Whilst the concerns of the Roads Department are acknowledged, it is noted that the proposal of this Planning Application is for the extension to an existing dwelling along the Rathcoole Hill Road, as opposed to the new dwelling previously refused permission under SD17A/0433. It is noted that there is an existing dwelling in place on the site, therefore the principle of associated domestic traffic is established. Furthermore, the Planning Authority is satisfied that the proposal would not necessarily amount to haphazard or ribbon development along the Rathcoole Hill Road.

The introduction of a new vehicular entrance and substantial hardstanding in the form of a new driveway would raise concerns regarding the visual impact of the proposal on the existing streetscape. In this regard, the Planning Authority consider that ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

should be requested from the Applicant demonstrating an amended Site Layout which utilises the existing vehicular entrance with a straight driveway arrangement and the removal of the extensive 'S' shaped driveway, to be replaced with additional grass and/or tree planting to enhance the visual appearance of the site from the adjacent public road.

To allay the concerns of the Roads Department, the Applicant should be requested to provide details of the trip generation in both the existing and proposed scenarios and provide an assessment of the impact to the adjacent road network. A visibility splay drawing should also be provided by the Applicant to demonstrate that adequate sightlines can be achieved from the vehicular entrance. This can be provided by way of ADDITIONAL INFORMATION.

Screening for Environmental Impact Assessment

Having regard to the modest nature of the proposed development, and the distance of the site from nearby sensitive receptors, there is no likelihood of significant effects on the environment arising from the proposed development. The need for environmental impact assessment can, therefore, be excluded at preliminary examination and a screening determination is not required.

Screening for Appropriate Assessment

The applicant has not provided information to assist the screening for Appropriate Assessment. Having regard to the nature of the development, connection to public services and the distance from the Natura 2000 sites the proposed development would not require a Stage 2 Appropriate Assessment.

Conclusion

Having regard to the 'RU' land-use zoning of the area, the relevant policies and objectives of the South Dublin County Development Plan 2016 – 2022 and the recommendations and the South Dublin House Extension Design Guide 2010 it is considered that the principle of the proposed residential extension is generally acceptable. However, a number of concerns arise in relation to design and scale of the proposal and clarification is required regarding the proposed access arrangements, boundary treatments, landscape and planting proposals and the drainage and water services infrastructure design of the proposed development. In this regard ADDITIONAL INFORMATION is required to facilitate a complete assessment of the proposed development and to demonstrate that the proposal would not seriously injure the residential and visual amenity of adjacent properties and would not significantly alter the character of the streetscape and surrounding receiving context.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Recommendation

I recommend that **ADDITIONAL INFORMATION** be requested from the applicant with regard to the following:

1. The Applicant is requested to address the following inaccuracies and deficiencies in the following information:
 - (i) Application Form - The Gross Floor Space of the Proposed Works and Demolition Works are not stated in response to Question No. 12.
 - (ii) Existing Drawings - The applicant is requested to provide existing plan, sectional and elevational drawings of the existing site layout and dwelling.
 - (iii) Section AA - There appears to be a discrepancy in the floor level dimensions provided, as the same figure is quoted for the ground floor level and parapet level. Furthermore, the detail shown on Section AA does not appear to accurately reflect the layout shown in the propose floor plan. The applicant is requested to provide an accurate sectional drawing of the proposed development.
 - (iv) The applicant is requested to provide a Landscape Plan, Planting Plan and a drawing demonstrating the existing and proposed boundary treatments in plan and elevational format.
 - (v) The Site & Roof Plan drawing appears to show a hipped roof profile to the proposed rear extensions with a flat roof profile to the glazed link. However, the Model View from South shown on the Floor Plans drawing appears to show a hipped roof profile to the glazed link and a flat roof to one of the rear extensions. The Applicant is requested to clarify this discrepancy and, if necessary provide an amended Roof Plan drawing.
 - (vi) The Applicant is requested to provide Site Characterisation and Suitability Report, as outlined in Section 11.3.4(ii) of the Development Plan.
2. The design of the proposed development should be revised to address/ include the following:
 - (i) Set back of the south elevation of the new side extension behind the side elevation of the host property;
 - (ii) Reorientation of the fenestration patterns at the south (side) elevation to provide a vertical emphasis so as to reflect the original fenestration pattern of the host property. The applicant is requested to provide a complete set of revised site layout, plan, sectional and elevational drawings at the appropriate scale to demonstrate the revised design.
3.
 - (i) An Engineering Report which details the cut and fill required for the proposed development and the drainage and water services infrastructure design. The Report should be accompanied with appropriate drawings as outlined below.
 - (ii) The applicant is requested to submit a drawing showing existing and proposed surface water drainage layouts up to and including the point of connection to the public surface water sewer. The drawing shall include the location of all Aj's, manholes, pipe size,

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

material type and direction of flow. The drawing shall clearly show that the foul and surface water systems are discharging to separate pipe networks.

(iii) The applicant is requested to submit a drawing showing plan and cross sectional views of proposed SuDS (Sustainable Drainage Systems) features for the development.

(iv) The applicant is requested to demonstrate that the proposed drainage and water services infrastructure complies with the standards, codes and practices of Irish Water in relation to water and wastewater.

4. The applicant is requested to revise the design of the proposed development as follows:
 - (i) Provide an amended Site Layout at a scale not less than 1:500, which demonstrates the utilisation of the existing vehicular entrance with a straight driveway arrangement and the removal of the extensive 'S' shaped driveway, to be replaced with additional grass and/or tree planting to enhance the visual appearance of the site from the adjacent public road.
 - (ii) Provide a Traffic Assessment which demonstrates the existing and proposed trips generated at the subject site.
 - (iii) Provide a visibility splay drawing to demonstrate that adequate sightlines can be achieved from the vehicular entrance.

Comhairle Chontae Atha Cliath Theas

PR/0336/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

REG. REF. SD22B/0020

LOCATION: Mount Carmel, Crookshane, Rathcoole, Co. Dublin

Colm Harte Type text here

Colm Harte
Senior Executive Planner

ORDER: I direct that **ADDITIONAL INFORMATION** be requested from the applicant as set out in the above report and that notice thereof be served on the applicant.

Date: 15.03.22

jjohnston
Jim Johnston,
Senior Executive Planner