

Michelle Dodrill

From: Planning - Registry
Subject: FW: Architectural Conservation Officers Report re SD22B/0020-Mount Carmel, Rathcoole

From: Irenie McLoughlin <imcloughlin@SDUBLINCOCO.ie>
Sent: Wednesday 9 March 2022 14:21
To: Conor Doyle <conordoyle@SDUBLINCOCO.ie>
Cc: Planning - Registry <pregistry@SDUBLINCOCO.ie>
Subject: Architectural Conservation Officers Report re SD22B/0020-Mount Carmel, Rathcoole

ARCHITECTURAL CONSERVATION OFFICERS REPORT
RE: SD22B/0020 - Mount Carmel, Crookshane, Rathcoole, Co. Dublin

Dear Conor,

I wish to provide the following comments in relation to the above planning application;

Appraisal

This is an application for an extension to the rear and side of the existing house to be refurbished including an undercroft lower floor level below the new extension providing access to the lower rear garden; works to the house will include replacing the existing entrance with a window, a new bay window to the side (southwest) elevation, new vehicle entrance gate, driveway and parking area to the west of the existing house, leading to a new glazed entrance and hall way to the side (existing garden and gates in front of the cottage to be retained); the rear extensions will provide new living/dining/kitchen facilities with the extended and refurbished cottage providing room four bedrooms; the undercroft level will provide a garden level play room as well as storage areas; works include for all services on and under land including a new effluent treatment system and new dry stone rubble boundary walls along the existing road.

The retention and refurbishment of the existing cottage at this location is welcomed. The proposed rear and side extension is delivered as a contemporary addition to the existing cottage and providing an undercroft lower floor allows the new build to sit at the same ridge height as the existing dwelling. The use of coursed rubble stone and lime render reflects the building reflects traditional finishes mixed with contemporary materials and finishes allows for a visually positive development. However, the undersigned has concerns with the lack of detail on the existing cottage. The existing timber sash windows should be retained and repair and upgraded appropriately. The render finish of the cottage is roughcast render and this should be followed through where the new build elements are visible from front site. There is no drawings showing the existing cottage as existing and indicating the proposed works, details of materials etc. In order to show that any new build reflects the material type and form in ensuring a cohesive addition more detail is required.

The cottage is positioned facing the Rathcoole Hill Road and it is important visually that the original form as a 3-bay cottage with central door is retained. The front door is a timber plank door with simple fanlight. The proposal to remove the front door and replace with a window and also to add a side bay window and relocated the front door as part of the proposed development should be reconsidered and redesigned taking account of the above concerns. Mount Carmel cottage is the only historic cottage along this Road as the majority of the development in this location are on-off new builds and although it is not included on the Record of Protected Structures, it is considered to be of architectural and historical merit.

As per the County Development Plan 2016-2022 the following policies should be noted;

HERITAGE, CONSERVATION AND LANDSCAPES (HCL) Policy 5 Older Buildings, Estates and Streetscapes

It is the policy of the Council to encourage the preservation of older features, buildings, and groups of structures that are of historic character including 19th Century and early to mid 20th Century houses, housing estates and streetscapes.

HCL5 Objective 1:

To retain existing houses that, while not listed as Protected Structures, are considered to contribute to historic character, local character, visual setting, rural amenity or streetscape value within the County.

HCL5 Objective 2:

To ensure that the redevelopment of older buildings, including extensions and renovation works do not compromise or erode the architectural interest, character or visual setting of such buildings including surrounding housing estates or streetscapes.

Any proposed refurbishment and additions to the single-storey, 3-bay cottage should ensure the retention of original features and original external form. It is considered that the south elevation (side extension) of the new build should be set back and how it then becomes connected to the existing cottage should be looked at in providing a defined link allowing a connection/entrance at this point, while retaining the front door of the original house albeit not in use as the main entrance. Setting back the new side extension will allow it to be more sensitive to the existing cottage. Fenestration at the south elevation (side elevation) should be vertical and should reflect the original fenestration but in contemporary way. This elevation should be broken up with cladding or materials to improve its appearance from the front site and road side.

There is no detail provided in relation to the refurbishment element of the proposal and a design rationale for the new extension to indicate that the rural site context and existing cottage have been given consideration as part of the overall design. It is recommended that further information be requested in providing a greater level of detail in this regard.

It is considered that additional information is required in order to address the concerns outlined above.

Recommendation

It is considered that following should be requested as part of a Request for Further Information:

There are concerns with the lack of detail on the existing cottage. The existing timber sash windows should be retained and repaired/upgraded appropriately. The render finish of the cottage is roughcast render and this should be followed through where the new build elements are visible from front site. Any new addition should reflect the form, simple vernacular style and material type of the existing cottage ensuring a cohesive addition. A design rationale should be provided in response site context of the proposed development.

A revised design should be considered to address the following:

- The proposal to remove the front door and to add a side bay window and relocated the front door as part of the proposed development should be reconsidered and redesigned taking account of the above issues. Mount Carmel cottage is the only historic cottage along this the Rathcoole Hill Road as the majority of the development in this location are one-off new builds and although it is not protected it is considered to be of architectural and historical value and any proposals should be looked at in accordance with the SDCC CDP (2016-2022) policies HCL 5 Objective 1 & 2.
- It is considered that the south elevation of the new side extension should be set back and how it then becomes connected to the existing cottage should be looked at in providing a defined link allowing a connection/entrance at this point while retaining the front door of the original house albeit not in use as the main entrance. Setting back the new side extension will allow it to be more sensitive to the existing cottage. Fenestration at the south elevation (side elevation) should be vertical and should reflect the original fenestration but in contemporary way. This elevation should be broken up with cladding or materials to improve its appearance from the front site and road side.

It is felt that there needs to be a balance between the original cottage and the proposed extension in providing a simple contemporary addition that is sensitive to the rural setting and the setting of the existing cottage along Rathcoole Hill Road. This should inform the necessary revisions to the proposed new extension.

I trust the above is in order.

Kind regards,
Irenie

Irenie McLoughlin
Architectural Conservation Officer
South Dublin County Council