PR/0126/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Reg. Reference:SD21B/0601Application Date:29-Nov-2021Submission Type:New ApplicationRegistration Date:29-Nov-2021

Correspondence Name and Address: Madeleine Moore Architect 44, Mountpleasant

Avenue Lower, Dublin 6

Proposed Development: Alterations to the existing single storey front extension

including removal of pitched roof profile; construction of new flat roofed ground and first floor extension over the existing garage conversion and extension to side and rear of house with roof lights; external insulation to front, side and rear; SuDS drainage; all associated

landscaping and site development works.

Location: 2, Club Road, Fox & Geese, Clondalkin, Dublin 22

Applicant Name: Declan Doherty & Lisa Hutchings

Application Type: Permission

(COS)

Description of Site and Surroundings

Site Area: stated as 0.0501 Hectares on the application.

Site Visit: 23rd of December 2021.

Site Description

The subject site is located on Club Road which contains a small enclave of houses within the largely industrial area of Fox & Geese off Naas Road. The site contains a two storey, semi-detached house adjacent to end of the cul de sac. The surrounding houses are of a similar form and character.

Proposal

Permission for alterations to the existing single storey front extension including removal of pitched roof profile; construction of new flat roofed ground and first floor extension over the existing garage conversion and extension to side and rear of house with roof lights; external insulation to front, side and rear; SuDS drainage; all associated landscaping and site development works.

Zoning

The subject site is subject to zoning objective 'REGEN': 'To facilitate enterprise and/or residential-led regeneration' under the South Dublin County Development Plan 2016-2022.

PR/0126/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Consultations

Water Services – further information requested in relation to surface water.

Irish Water – no objection subject to conditions.

Roads Department – further information requested.

Planning Delivery – no objection.

SEA Sensitivity Screening – no overlap indicated.

Submissions/Observations / Representations

None received.

Relevant Planning History

SD21B/0331

Removal of pitched roof to existing single storey front extension; construction of new flat roofed first floor extension over the existing garage conversion and extension to side of rear house; with roof light; single story flat roofed extension with roof light to rear; external insulation to rear; SuDS drainage and all associated landscaping and site development works. **Permission granted for the single storey rear extension and permission refused for the first floor extension.**

SD08B/0005

Conversion and extension of the existing garage into a new vented lobby, W.C. and study area, the extension of the existing hallway to incorporate a new entrance porch for the provision of a new staircase, the realignment and widening of the existing site entrance, and all associated site works. **Permission granted.**

Relevant Enforcement History

None relevant to the subject application.

Pre-Planning Consultation

None recorded for the subject application according to APAS.

Relevant Policy in South Dublin County Council Development Plan 2016 – 2022

1 Introduction & Core Strategy

Policy CS6 Local Area Plans

CS6 SLO 1:

To initiate a plan led approach to the sustainable regeneration of the brownfield lands in the Naas Road/Ballymount REGEN zoned lands. The plan led approach will include the preparation of a masterplan in 2019 with a view to preparing a Local Area Plan or other appropriate mechanism

PR/0126/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

for the Regeneration (REGEN) and Local Centre (LC) at Walkinstown zoned lands. The masterplan will provide a framework for the sequential and phased development of the lands, integrating sustainable transport, land use and blue and green infrastructure. The spatial planning of the area will be informed by the Naas Road Framework Plan (2010).

2 Housing

Section 2.4.1 Residential Extensions

Policy H18 Residential Extensions

It is the policy of the Council to support the extension of existing dwellings subject to the protection of residential and visual amenities.

Policy H18 Objective 1:

To favourably consider proposals to extend existing dwellings subject to the protection of residential and visual amenities and compliance with the standards set out in Chapter 11 Implementation and the guidance set out in the South Dublin County Council House Extension Design Guide, 2010 (or any superseding guidelines).

7 Infrastructure & Environmental Quality

Policy IE 1 Water & Wastewater

Policy IE 2 Surface Water & Groundwater

Policy IE 7 Environmental Quality

8 Green Infrastructure

Policy G1 Overarching

Policy G2 Green Infrastructure Network

Policy G5 Sustainable Urban Drainage Systems

Policy G6 New Development in Urban Areas

9. Heritage, Conservation & Landscapes

Policy HCL2 Natura 2000 sites

11 Implementation

Section 11.3.1 Residential

Section 11.3.1 (iv) Dwelling Standards

Section 11.3.1 (v) Privacy

Section 11.3.3 Additional Accommodation

Section 11.3.3 (i) Extensions

Section 11.4.2 Car Parking Standards

Table 11.24 Maximum Parking Rates (Residential Development)

Section 11.4.4 Car Parking Design and Layout

PR/0126/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Section 11.6.0 Infrastructure and Environmental Quality

Section 11.7.2 Energy Performance in New Buildings

Section 11.8.1 Environmental Impact Assessment

Section 11.8.2 Appropriate Assessment

South Dublin County Council House Extension Design Guide (2010)

The House Extension Design Guide contains the following guidance on house extensions. Elements of Good Extension Design:

- Respect the appearance and character of the house and local area;
- Provide comfortable internal space and useful outside space;
- Do not overlook, overshadow or have an overbearing affect on properties next door;
- Consider the type of extension that is appropriate and how to integrate it; and
- Incorporate energy efficient measures where possible.

Front extensions:

- Keep the extension simple and complementary to the style of the house by reflecting the style and details of the main house, e.g. window location, shape, type, proportion and sill details.
- Reflect the roof shape and slope of the main house.
- Match or complement the materials used in the main house.
- Try to expose and complement rather than hide or cover original distinctive features of a house such as bay windows.
- Keep front boundary walls or railings, particularly if they are characteristic of the street or area.
- Try to maintain a minimum driveway length of 6m.
- Avoid extensions that are dominant or overlarge in relation to the scale and appearance of the house.
- Avoid excessive use of 'cosmetic' features such as mock classical columns, Spanish arches, decorative lattice fascia boards, balustrades, stonework, etc., that are not typical of the design of the original house.
- Avoid building an extension more than 1.5m in front of the existing front wall of the house if there is a regular building line along the street.

Side extensions:

- Respect the style of the house and the amount of space available between it and the neighbouring property, for example:
- if there is a large gap to the side of the house, and the style of house lends itself to it, a seamless extension may be appropriate;
- if there is not much space to the side of the house and any extension is likely to be close to the boundary, an ancillary style of extension set back from the building line is more appropriate;

PR/0126/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

- if the house is detached or on a large site or in a prominent location such as the corner of a street, it may be appropriate to consider making a strong architectural statement with the extension.
- Match or complement the style, materials and details of the main house unless there are good architectural reasons for doing otherwise. Where the style and materials do not seamlessly match the main house, it is best to recess a side extension by at least 50cm to mark the change.
- Leave a gap of at least 1m between the extension and the side party boundary with the adjoining property to avoid creating a terraced effect. A larger gap may be required if that is typical between properties along the street.
- If no gap can be retained, try to recess side extensions back from the front building line of the main house by at least 50cm and have a lower roof eaves and ridge line to minimise the terracing effect. In the case of a first floor extension over an existing garage or car port that is flush with the building line of the main house, the first floor extension should be recessed by at least 50cm.
- Match the roof shape and slope of the existing house. In the case of houses with hipped roofs it can be particularly difficult to continue the ridge line and roof shape; however it is more visually pleasing to do so if this will not result in a terracing effect with the adjoining house.
- Avoid creating a terraced effect and awkward join between the rooflines of two adjacent properties if building up to the party boundary.
- Do not include a flat roof to a prominent extension unless there is good design or an architectural reason for doing so.
- Do not incorporate blank gable walls where extensions face onto public footpaths and roads.
- The use of a 'false' roof to hide a flat roofed extension is rarely successful, particularly if visible from the side.
- Avoid locating unsightly pipework on side elevations that are visible from public view. Consider disguising or recessing the pipework if possible.
- Extending a hipped roof to the side to create a gabled end or half-hip will rarely be acceptable, particularly if the hipped roof is visually prominent and typical of other houses along the street.
- Avoid the use of prominent parapet walls to the top of side extensions.

Rear extensions:

- Match or complement the style, materials and details of the main house unless there are good architectural reasons for doing otherwise.
- Match the shape and slope of the roof of the existing house, although flat roofed single storey extensions may be acceptable if not prominent from a nearby public road or area.
- Make sure enough rear garden is retained.
- Do not create a higher ridge level than the roof of the main house.
- The roofline of large extensions to the rear of single storey bungalows should not be visible from public view to the front or to the side of the bungalow.

PR/0126/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Relevant Government Guidelines

Project Ireland 2040 National Planning Framework, Government of Ireland, (2018).

Regional Spatial & Economic Strategy 2019 - 2031, Eastern & Midlands Regional Assembly, (2019).

Section 5 – Dublin Metropolitan Area Strategic Plan, in Regional Spatial and Economic Strategy 2019 – 2031.

Sustainable Residential Development in Urban Areas - Guidelines for Planning Authorities, Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government (2009).

Urban Design Manual: A Best Practice Guide, A Companion Document to the Guidelines for Planning Authorities on Sustainable Residential Development in Urban Areas, Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government, (2009).

Quality Housing for Sustainable Communities-Best Practice Guidelines, Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government, (2007).

Appropriate Assessment of Plans and Projects in Ireland – Guidance for Planning Authorities, Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government, (2009).

Assessment

The main issues for assessment relate to:

- Zoning and Council Policy;
- Previous Reasons for Refusal;
- Visual and Residential Amenity;
- Services and Drainage;
- Access and Parking;
- Environmental Impact Assessment; and
- Appropriate Assessment.

Zoning and Council Policy

The subject site is within zoning objective 'REGEN': 'To facilitate enterprise and/or residential led regeneration'. Residential extensions to existing dwellings in 'REGEN' zoned lands are subject to compliance with the relevant policies, standards and requirements of the current South Dublin County Council Development Plan 2016-2022. The principle of the proposed development is acceptable at this location.

These REGEN lands are subject to the city edge framework currently being developed under CS6 Specific Local Objective 1. SDCC's Planning Delivery Team have reviewed the proposed development and have no objection to the principle of the development due to its location and scale. The proposed development therefore complies with CS6 Specific Local Objective 1.

PR/0126/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Previous Reasons for Refusal

There was a recent permission for the site (Reg. Ref. SD21B/0331) which was a split decision to grant and refuse as follows:

- <u>Grant permission</u> for the single storey rear extension measuring 15.04sq.m (approximately) (internally).
- **Refuse permission** for the 25sq.m (approximate) first floor extension as it does not comply with objectives of the South Dublin County Council Development Plan and the South Dublin House Design Guidance by way design and scale of the development proposed, as it would negatively impact on the visual amenity of the area, the design approach would not reflect the character of the area and as such set an undesirable precedent for similar type of development.

The reasons for refusal for the first floor extension were as follows:

- 1. Having regard to the scale and size of the extension at this prominent location and the projection forward of the front building line at first floor level, the projection upwards above the existing eaves level, the proposed development would seriously injure the visual amenities of the area and would be visually obtrusive and out of character within the established residential area, and would be contrary to the provisions of the South Dublin County Development Plan 2016-2022 and the SDCC House Extension Design Guide. The proposed development therefore is contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.
- 2. The proposed development would set an undesirable precedent for other similar developments, which would in themselves and cumulatively, be harmful to the residential and visual amenities of the area and would be contrary to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

The applicant states that the subject application is in response to this part refusal. The proposed development under Reg. Ref. SD21B/0331 is being applied for again in full and has been revised to include the following changes:

- The first floor side extension has been setback from the front so that it is 500m behind the front elevation of the existing dwelling.
- Floor and ceiling levels designed to match existing.
- Rear extension has been amended so that it extends approx. 2.8 m from the rear building line and approx. 9.6 m in width.
- The two storey element of the extension would now extend further from the existing rear building line by approx. 2.8 m.

PR/0126/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

The setback of the first floor side extension is welcomed. However, the Planning Authority still has concerns regarding the design and scale of this extension. The extension would be approx. 6.5m in overall height and extend 10.4m in depth (revised from 11m). Adjoining property No. 3 Club Road has its dwelling set further back from the front boundary than the dwelling at the subject site. Therefore any extension on the side would be highly visible from this adjoining property and the streetscape.

The design still does not reflect the character, design or fenestration of the existing house and surrounding residential area. The extension would still have a flat roof and would not integrate with the hipped roof profile of the existing dwelling. It would sit higher than the eaves of the existing dwelling and therefore appear out of scale and character with the dwelling. The revised design is therefore not considered to fully comply with the 2010 House Extension Design Guide.

It is considered that the reasons for refusal have not been fully overcome. The applicant should be requested to submit via additional information a revised design for the first floor side extension. This should include a revised roof form to integrate with the existing hipped roof. The proposed fenestration should match that of the existing dwelling.

Visual and Residential Amenity

The proposed design of the first floor extension is not considered to comply with the 2010 House Extension Design Guide and accord with visual and residential amenity. The use of a flat roof on the two storey element of the proposal is considered to be visually obtrusive, especially given the extension would sit above the eaves height of the existing dwelling. As advised above the extension should be revised to integrate better with the existing dwelling and surrounding residential area.

The single storey rear extension would extend across the majority of the width of the site save for a setback of approx. 0.7m from the side (south-eastern) boundary. The rear extension would be incorporated into the side extension. The rear extension would have a flat roof; however, this would not be visible prominent. It would be approx. 3.5m in overall height. Given the scale and design of the rear extension it is not considered that it would have a significant impact on visual and residential amenity.

The proposed extensions would provide for an extended dining/living room and kitchen at ground floor level and additional bedrooms at first floor level. The proposed new bedrooms would meet the minimum floorspace requirements of the County Development Plan (Bedroom 5 for a single bedroom). The proposal would leave sufficient rear amenity space.

PR/0126/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

The exterior of the new extensions are proposed to be finished in a smooth render. This would complement the existing dwelling and is in compliance with the House Extension Design Guide.

The installation of a flat roof over the existing single storey front extension is considered to be visually acceptable in this instance.

Services and Drainage

Water Services has reviewed the proposed development and requests further information in relation to surface water:

- 1.1 There are no soil percolation test results, design calculations or dimensions submitted for the proposed soakaway. The applicant is required to submit a report showing site specific soil percolation test results and design calculations for the proposed soakaway in accordance with BRE Digest 365 Soakaway Design.
- 1.2 The applicant is required to submit a revised drawing showing plan & cross-sectional views, dimensions, and location of proposed soakaway. Any proposed soakaway shall be located fully within the curtilage of the property and shall be:
- *i)* At least 5m from any building, public sewer, road boundary or structure.
- *Generally, not within 3m of the boundary of the adjoining property.*
- iii) Not in such a position that the ground below foundations is likely to be adversely affected.
- iv) 10m from any sewage treatment percolation area and from any watercourse / floodplain.
- *y)* Soakaways must include an overflow connection to the surface water drainage network.
- 1.3 Include water butts as part of additional SuDS (Sustainable Drainage Systems) for the proposed development.

This report is noted and should be requested via additional information.

Irish Water has reviewed the proposed development and has no objection subject to standard conditions.

Access and Parking

The Roads Department has reviewed the proposed development and requests additional information:

The applicant has not submitted any compliance documents in regards with condition 7 under planning application SD08B/0005. The Roads Section consider that no further planning permissions should be granted for this site until all conditions of previously granted planning permissions have been complied with fully, particularly condition 7 under granted planning application SD08B/0005.

Roads recommend that additional information be requested from the applicant:

PR/0126/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

- 1. The applicant shall submit a revised layout of not less than 1:100 scale, showing provision for 2no. on curtilage parking spaces at the proposed site, including a swept path analysis showing two cars can safely access and egress the proposed development.
- 2. The development shall otherwise comply with all relevant conditions attached to the previously granted permission, SD08B/0005, specifically Condition 7 (Roads Department requirements).

While the report from Roads is noted, however, the subject application does not alter the existing setback of the front extension and therefore should not be addressed as part of this application.

Screening for Environmental Impact Assessment

Having regard to the modest nature of the proposed development, and the distance of the site from nearby sensitive receptors, there is no likelihood of significant effects on the environment arising from the proposed development. The need for environmental impact assessment can, therefore, be excluded at preliminary examination and a screening determination is not required.

Screening for Appropriate Assessment

The applicant has not provided information to assist the screening for Appropriate Assessment. Having regard to the nature of the development, connection to public services and the distance from the Natura 2000 sites the proposed development would not require a Stage 2 Appropriate Assessment.

Conclusion

Having regard to the:

- provisions of the South Dublin County Development Plan 2016-2022 and South Dublin County Council House Extension Design Guide (2010),
- the established character of the area, and
- the nature and scale of the proposed development,

it is considered that **Additional Information** is required to ensure the proposed development would be in compliance with Council policy, would not seriously injure the amenities of the area or of property in the vicinity and would, therefore, be in accordance with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

PR/0126/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Recommendation

I recommend that **ADDITIONAL INFORMATION** be requested from the applicant with regard to the following:

- 1. The first floor side extension has been revised from what was previously refused under Reg. Ref. SD21B/0331. The setback of this first floor side extension is welcomed. However, the Planning Authority still has concerns regarding its design and scale. It therefore considered that the reasons for refusal (under Reg. Ref. SD21B/0331) have not been fully overcome. The applicant is requested to submit a revised design for the first floor side extension to address the Planning Authority's concerns. The revised design should include a revised roof form that integrates with the existing hipped roof of the dwelling. The proposed fenestration should match that of the existing dwelling. A full set of revised proposed drawings should be submitted for assessment.
- 2. The applicant is requested to submit the following in relation to surface water:
 - (a) A report showing site specific soil percolation test results and design calculations for the proposed soakaway in accordance with BRE Digest 365 Soakaway Design.
 - (b) A revised drawing showing plan & cross-sectional views, dimensions, and location of proposed soakaway. Any proposed soakaway shall be located fully within the curtilage of the property and shall be:
 - (i) At least 5m from any building, public sewer, road boundary or structure.
 - (ii) Generally, not within 3m of the boundary of the adjoining property.
 - (iii) Not in such a position that the ground below foundations is likely to be adversely affected.
 - (iv) 10m from any sewage treatment percolation area and from any watercourse / floodplain.
 - (v) Soakaways must include an overflow connection to the surface water drainage network
 - (c) Include water butts as part of additional SuDS (Sustainable Drainage Systems) for the proposed development.

PR/0126/22

Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

REG. REF. SD21B/0601 LOCATION: 2, Club Road, Fox & Geese, Clondalkin, Dublin 22

Sarah Watson,

Executive Planner

Salton

ORDER:

I direct that **ADDITIONAL INFORMATION** be requested from the applicant as set out in the above report and that notice thereof be served on the applicant.

Date:

Eoin Burke, Senior Planner