# PR/1572/21

#### Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

Reg. Reference:SD21B/0530Application Date:13-Oct-2021Submission Type:New ApplicationRegistration Date:13-Oct-2021

**Correspondence Name and Address:** Tara Cooke 13, Clarinda Park North, Dun Laoghaire,

Co. Dublin

**Proposed Development:** Partial demolition and reconstruction of a 2 storey,

corner extension to the rear; provision of a new flat roof with rooflight to this extension; demolition of the two storey extension at the centre of the back (east) of the house; construction of a new flat roofed two storey extension with roof lights; repairs to windows with replacements where necessary or appropriate; construction of single storey bay extension with pitched roof to the south elevation at lower ground floor/basement level; minor internal alterations, general refurbishment, provision of maintenance access to centre valley, addition of photovoltaic panels,

repairs to plasterwork, increase in height of rear garden boundary wall to the north; outbuilding to the rear, internal alterations, roof repairs, new doors and window and general refurbishment; minor hard and soft landscaping works including parking area to the northeast; all ancillary site works above and below

ground.

**Location:** Oak Lodge, New Road, Clondalkin, Dublin 22,

D22F516

**Applicant Name:** Thomas & Hazel Reilly

**Application Type:** Permission

(DF)

### **Description of Site and Surroundings**

Site Visit: 04/11/2021

Site Area: 0.16 ha

# PR/1572/21

## Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

### Site Description:

Oak Lodge is a detached house and protected structure (No.156 as per the CDP) located along New Road in Clondalkin opposite the Immaculate Conception Church. To the rear is Laurel Park with semi-detached units located to the north and a detached located house to the south. Access is off New Road.

## **Proposal:**

The proposed development comprises:

- Partial demolition and reconstruction of a 2 storey, corner extension to the rear;
- provision of a new flat roof with rooflight to this extension;
- demolition of the two-storey extension at the centre of the back (east) of the house;
- construction of a new flat roofed two storey extension with roof lights;
- repairs to windows with replacements where necessary or appropriate;
- construction of single storey bay extension with pitched roof to the south elevation at lower ground floor/basement level; minor internal alterations, general refurbishment, provision of maintenance access to centre valley, addition of photovoltaic panels, repairs to plasterwork, increase in height of rear garden boundary wall to the north; outbuilding to the rear, internal alterations, roof repairs, new doors and window and general refurbishment;
- minor hard and soft landscaping works including parking area to the northeast; all ancillary site works above and below ground.

#### **Zoning:**

The subject site is subject to zoning objective 'RES' - 'To protect and/or improve residential amenity'.

Oak Lodge, New Road, Clondalkin is a protected structure (no. 156 as per the CDP- Detached Three Bay Single Storey Over Basement House)

#### **Consultations:**

Water Services- Additional information requested
Irish Water – No response
Roads Section – No objection subject to standard conditions
Parks –No comments
ACO-Additional information requested
Heritage Officer-No response
An Taisce- No response

## **SEA Sensitivity Screening**

No. 156 as per the CDP protected structure. *Oak Lodge, New Road, Clondalkin- Detached Three Bay Single Storey Over Basement House* 

# PR/1572/21

### Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

## **Submissions/Observations/Representations**

None received. Final date for submissions 16/11/21.

#### **Relevant Planning History**

Subject site
None recorded

#### Adjacent Sites

SD02A/0323. Demolition of existing school building and associated prefabricated buildings and the construction of a new school to consist of a part single storey and part two storey P.E. hall and general purpose area, a single storey technical block and library, a three storey general classroom block, landscaping and associated site works and services including car parking and revisions to entrance

Grant permission

S99B/0489. Conservatory and garage conversion.

**Grant Permission** 

## **Relevant Enforcement History**

None recorded for subject site

#### **Pre-Planning Consultation**

None.

## Relevant Policy in South Dublin County Council Development Plan 2016-2022

(HCL) Policy 1 Overarching

It is the policy of the Council to protect, conserve and enhance natural, built and cultural heritage features, and to support the objectives and actions of the County Heritage Plan.

#### (HCL) Policy 3 Protected Structures

It is the policy of the Council to conserve and protect buildings, structures and sites contained in the Record of Protected Structures and to carefully consider any proposals for development that would affect the special character or appearance of a Protected Structure including its historic curtilage, both directly and indirectly.

### HCL5 Objective 1:

To retain existing houses that, while not listed as Protected Structures, are considered to contribute to historic character, local character, visual setting, rural amenity or streetscape value within the County.

# PR/1572/21

## Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

# HCL5 Objective 4:

To ensure that infill development is sympathetic to the architectural interest, character and visual amenity of the area.

#### Section 2.4.1 Residential Extensions

Policy H18 Residential Extensions

It is the policy of the Council to support the extension of existing dwellings subject to the protection of residential and visual amenities.

Section 11.3.3 Additional Accommodation

Section 11.3.3 (i) Extensions

The design of residential extensions should accord with the South Dublin County Council House Extension Guide (2010) or any superseding standards

#### For front extensions:

- Keep the extension simple and complementary to the style of the house reflecting the style and details of the main house, e.g. window location, shape, type, proportion and sill details,
- Reflect the roof shape and slope of the main house,
- Try to expose and complement rather than hide or cover original distinctive features or a house such as bay windows,
- Keep front boundary walls or railings particularly if they are characteristic of the street or area,
- Try to maintain a minimum driveway length of 6m,
- Where an integrated garage is to be incorporated into an extension, doors should be recessed by at least 30-50cm from the front wall of the extension and the garage door designed to include vertical elements,
- Avoid extensions that are dominant or over-large in relation to the scale and appearance of the house,
- Avoid excessive use of 'cosmetic' features such as mock classical columns, Spanish arches, decorative lattice, fascia boards, balustrades, stonework, etc., that are not typical of the design of the original house,
- Avoid building an extension more than 1.5m in front of the existing front wall of the house if there is a regular building line along the street.

#### For rear extensions:

- Match or complement the style, materials and details of the main house unless there are good architectural reasons for doing otherwise.
- Match the shape and slope of the roof of the existing house, although flat-roofed single storey extensions may be acceptable if not prominent from a nearby public road or area.
- Make sure enough rear garden is retained.
- Do not create a higher ridge level than the roof of the main house.

# PR/1572/21

### Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

- The roofline of large extensions to the rear of single storey bungalows should not be visible from public view to the front or to the side of the bungalow.

## **Relevant Government Guidelines**

Project Ireland 2040 National Planning Framework, Government of Ireland, 2018

Regional, Spatial & Economic Strategy 2019 - 2031, Eastern & Midlands Regional Assembly, 2019.

Sustainable Residential Development in Urban Areas - Guidelines for Planning Authorities, Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government (2008).

*Urban Design Manual: A Best Practice Guide*, A Companion Document to the Guidelines for Planning Authorities on Sustainable Residential Development in Urban Areas, Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government, (2008).

Quality Housing for Sustainable Communities-Best Practice Guidelines, Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government, (2007).

*Design Manual for Urban Roads and Streets*, Department of the Environment, Community and Local Government and Department of Transport, Tourism and Sport, (2013).

Appropriate Assessment of Plans and Projects in Ireland – Guidance for Planning Authorities, Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government, (2009)

*The Planning System and Flood Risk Management - Guidelines for Planning Authorities*, Department of the Environment, Heritage and Local Government & OPW, (2009).

Site Layout Planning for Daylight and Sunlight: A Guide to Good Practice, Building Research Establishment, (1991).

#### Assessment

The main issues for assessment are:

- Zoning
- Residential Amenity, Visual Impact and Layout
- Residential Amenity, Overlooking, Overshadowing
- Architectural Conservation Officer
- Water Services
- Screening for Appropriate Assessment
- Environmental Impact Assessment

# PR/1572/21

## **Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order**

# **Zoning**

The site is subject to the land-use zoning objective, 'RES' – 'To protect and improve residential amenity'. Residential development is permitted in principle under this zoning objective.

Oak Lodge, New Road, Clondalkin is a protected structure (No. 156 as per the CDP- Detached Three Bay Single Storey Over Basement House)

## Residential Amenity, Visual Impact and Layout

#### **Rear Extension**

- The flat roof asbestos roof and mono-pitched section will be removed and replaced with a flat roof, with part of the existing extension to be demolished.
- A proposed rear bay window extension is proposed which projects 0.7m. This results in a portion of the existing rear extension wall being demolished.
- This extension will provide an ensuite to bedroom #2, utility room, and larger back entrance room, and wc.
- The maximum height of the flat roof extension will increase to 6.077m, from the existing height 5.4m. This is significantly below the ridge line of the main dwelling but above the existing eaves height. An element of the rear extension will be 5.88m in height to flat roof.
- Roof lights will be incorporated, and rear obscure glazing to the wc. This will be secured by planning condition.
- The proposal satisfies the minimum sizes and internal room areas as per the CPD and the Quality Housing for Sustainable Communities 2007.

#### Rear Outbuilding

- A 4.7m high hipped roof home gym and shed will be provided to the rear (49.45sq.m combined), within an existing building. A partition wall is proposed to be removed as part of the application to join the two internal rooms.
- New windows and doors will replace the rotten ones.
- A suitable planning condition will ensure it is not used for habitable purposes.

#### Residential Amenity, Overlooking, Overshadowing

The distance from the northern boundary is 5.9m. This does not reduce the existing separation distance from the boundary or the adjacent property to the north. It is also located 13m from the rear boundary, and 18m from the southern boundary.

The separation distance from the adjacent properties and rear boundary is acceptable. The development will not have an adverse impact on the residential amenity of the adjacent properties or the area by way of significant overlooking or overshadowing. It will not detract from the general appearance of the existing dwelling and, subject to the addressment of the Architectural Conservation Officer's concerns, in this regard is considered to be acceptable.

# PR/1572/21

### Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

## Patio Area

The existing patio area will be removed and replaced with a new hardstanding area, to the south of the building. A new 2.9m high mono pitched projecting bay window and patio door is also proposed. The alignment of the existing low retaining wall will be changed to accommodate the larger patio area.

### **Boundary Treatments**

The proposed north rear boundary wall which encloses the rear amenity area shall be 2m in height. This will replace an existing wall of varying heights. The new wall is acceptable and will be similar to the rear boundary block wall.

## Architectural Conservation Officer (ACO)

The ACO has raised a number of minor concerns and has requested further information regarding the following:

- '1. Works to address the damp problems at basement level were agreed and approved as exempted development during June 2021. Those exempted works were deemed acceptable based on the details provided at that time, however additional works are now detailed in the planning application at basement level, which now includes the insertion of underfloor heating which had not been previously specified as part of the exempted works in providing a new concrete slab. Other works which will impact on the conditions of the basement include a proposed new shower room and insertion of wall linings.
  - It is considered that further detail and clarification is required in relation to the underfloor heating as this was not previously detailed as part of the new concrete slab.
  - Details and specifications are required for the proposed wall linings ensuring these are breathable and internal insulation is done adhering to best practice.
  - Ventilation needs to be addressed at basement level in particular where a new shower room will be inserted.

Full details to address these items are required in order to fully assess the impact to the original built fabric of the Protected Structure. Details of which should be included as part of a full method statement and schedule of works for all works to the protected structure including specifications for materials and new interventions.

2. A Conservation Report/Method Statement has been provided but the details read as a summary of works and do not provide a detailed Method Statement and Schedule of Works for each floor level and element of works proposed. The Architectural Impact Assessment has not provided details on the direct impacts to the original built fabric in assessing the scope of works proposed. The architectural impact assessment has failed to provide an assessment of the proposed partial demolition and reconstruction of two-storey extension, side patio extension and photovoltaic panels with regard to direct impacts and visual impacts. New interventions and new elements should have

# PR/1572/21

### Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

been included as part of any assessments with regard to overall impacts. It is considered that a greater level of information is required in particular to ascertain why the proposed new designed extension which is to be a flat roof now exceeds the height of the existing extension.

3. It is also proposed to add photovoltaic panels which will be positioned facing into the centre valley. Additional details for the insertion of photovoltaic panels and the works involved to facilitate their use have not been provided.

It is considered that further information and specifications are required for this work, details should include;

- *Information on the panel loads and their effect on the existing roof.*
- The effects of any increase in loading should be identified to ensure this impact is addressed with regard to safety structural issues and any direct impact to the original roof.
- Details and specifications should be included on how the panels will be mounted. Associated works and additional services/items etc should be included as part of the methodology for the insertion of the photovoltaic panels in order to identify and highlight any such works to facilitate their use on a Protected Structure.
- 4. It is proposed to construct a side extension with a pitched roof in the form of a bay with sliding sash window side lights over timber panels with French doors onto a new patio which will replace an existing uPVC side door and poor quality patio area. It is considered that this element is fussy in design and pastiche in trying to match the existing first floor bay window. It is considered that any such modest side extension should be simple in design and form and should allow for a contemporary addition at this location in contrast to original architectural features and design of the existing house, thereby clearly showing it as a modern intervention and addition to the existing house. It is therefore considered that this element should be redesigned and revised to address the above concern.
- 5. It is proposed to reuse the existing rear single-storey outbuilding. As part of the works to the existing outbuilding it is proposed to remove the original internal wall and replace with a new wall which appears to be virtually in the same location. The replacement of the original internal wall with a new wall is deemed unnecessary and needs to be justified. Details to clarify this issue should be submitted as well as proper justification for the proposed removal of the original internal wall. A proper photographic survey of the existing outbuilding should be provided to show the full extent of the interior of the structure.'

The following items will be addressed by way of additional information.

#### Water Services

Water services has requested further information regarding surface water drainage and soakaways, porous paving in the car parking areas, and cross sections of filter drains.

# PR/1572/21

## Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

These will be requested as additional information.

## Screening for Environmental Impact Assessment

Having regard to the modest nature of the proposed development, and the distance of the site from nearby sensitive receptors, there is no likelihood of significant effects on the environment arising from the proposed development. The need for environmental impact assessment can, therefore, be excluded at preliminary examination and a screening determination is not required.

# Screening for Appropriate Assessment

The applicant has not provided information to assist the screening for Appropriate Assessment. Having regard to the nature of the development, connection to public services and the distance from the Natura 2000 sites the proposed development would not require a Stage 2 Appropriate Assessment.

### **Development Contributions:**

- Partial demolition and reconstruction of a 2 storey, corner extension to the rear;
- provision of a new flat roof with rooflight to this extension;
- demolition of the two storey extension at the centre of the back (east) of the house;
- construction of a new flat roofed two storey extension with roof lights;
- repairs to windows with replacements where necessary or appropriate;
- construction of single storey bay extension with pitched roof to the south elevation at lower ground floor/basement level; minor internal alterations, general refurbishment, provision of maintenance access to centre valley, addition of photovoltaic panels, repairs to plasterwork, increase in height of rear garden boundary wall to the north; outbuilding to the rear, internal alterations, roof repairs, new doors and window and general refurbishment;
- minor hard and soft landscaping works including parking area to the northeast; all ancillary site works above and below ground.

Additional floor space 33.3sq.m. No previous recorded extension.

SEA Monitoring Information	
<b>Building Use Type Proposed</b>	Floor Area (sq.m)
Residential – additional floor space	33.3sq.m
Land Type	Site Area (Ha.)
Brownfield/Urban Consolidation	0.16

#### **Conclusion**

Additional information is requested for a number of items. However, considering the pattern of development in the vicinity and the design and layout of the proposed residential development, it is considered that, subject to the submission of appropriate AI that the proposed development would

# PR/1572/21

### Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

likely not seriously injure the amenities of the area or property in the vicinity, therefore, will likely be in accordance with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.

#### **Recommendation**

I recommend that **ADDITIONAL INFORMATION** be requested from the applicant with regard to the following:

- 1. The Architectural Conservation Officer has raised a number of items of concerns and has requested that the following information be submitted to allow for a full assessment to take place:
  - (1) Works to address the damp problems at basement level were agreed and approved as exempted development during June 2021. Those exempted works were deemed acceptable based on the details provided at that time, however additional works are now detailed in the planning application at basement level, which now includes the insertion of underfloor heating which had not been previously specified as part of the exempted works in providing a new concrete slab. Other works which will impact on the conditions of the basement include a proposed new shower room and insertion of wall linings.
  - (i) It is considered that further detail and clarification is required in relation to the underfloor heating as this was not previously detailed as part of the new concrete slab.
  - (ii) Details and specifications are required for the proposed wall linings ensuring these are breathable and internal insulation is done adhering to best practice.
  - (iii) Ventilation needs to be addressed at basement level in particular where a new shower room will be inserted.

Full details to address each of these items are required in order to fully assess the impact to the original built fabric of the Protected Structure. Details of which should be included as part of a full method statement and schedule of works for all works to the protected structure including specifications for materials and new interventions.

- (2)(a) A Conservation Report/Method Statement has been provided but the details read as a summary of works and do not provide a detailed Method Statement and Schedule of Works for each floor level and element of works proposed. A revised and detailed Method Statement and Schedule of Works for each floor level and element of works proposed should be submitted for assessment.
- (b) The Architectural Impact Assessment has not provided details on the direct impacts to the original built fabric in assessing the scope of works proposed and has failed to provide an assessment of the proposed partial demolition and reconstruction of two-storey extension, side patio extension and photovoltaic panels with regard to direct impacts and visual impacts. A revised Architectural Impact Assessment addressing the above points and including all new interventions and new elements should be submitted and include any assessments with regard to overall impacts.
- (c) It is considered that a greater level of information is required in particular to ascertain why the proposed new designed extension which is to be a flat roof now exceeds the

# PR/1572/21

#### Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

height of the existing extension. The applicant is requested to justify this element and reduce the overall height to below the existing eaves level.

- (3) It is proposed to add photovoltaic panels which will be positioned facing into the centre valley.
- (a) Additional details for the insertion of photovoltaic panels and the works involved to facilitate their use are requested and should be submitted.
- (b) Further information and specifications are required for this work, details should include:
- (i) Information on the panel loads and their effect on the existing roof.
- (ii) The effects of any increase in loading should be identified to ensure this impact is addressed with regard to safety structural issues and any direct impact to the original roof.
- (iii) Details and specifications should be included on how the panels will be mounted. Associated works and additional services/items etc should be included as part of the methodology for the insertion of the photovoltaic panels in order to identify and highlight any such works to facilitate their use on a Protected Structure.
- (4) It is proposed to construct a side extension with a pitched roof in the form of a bay with sliding sash window side lights over timber panels with French doors onto a new patio which will replace an existing uPVC side door and poor quality patio area. It is considered that this element is fussy in design and pastiche in trying to match the existing first floor bay window. It is considered that any such modest side extension should be simple in design and form and should allow for a contemporary addition at this location in contrast to original architectural features and design of the existing house, thereby clearly showing it as a modern intervention and addition to the existing house. The applicant is requested to submit a revised proposal for this element, which should be redesigned and revised to address the above concern.
- (5) It is proposed to reuse the existing rear single-storey outbuilding. As part of the works to the existing outbuilding it is proposed to remove the original internal wall and replace with a new wall which appears to be virtually in the same location. The replacement of the original internal wall with a new wall is deemed unnecessary and needs to be justified. Details to clarify this issue should be submitted as well as proper justification for the proposed removal of the original internal wall. A full photographic survey of the existing outbuilding should be provided to show the full extent of the interior of the structure.
- 2. The following shall be submitted by way of additional information:
  - (1) There are no soil percolation test results, design calculations or dimensions submitted for the proposed soakaway. The applicant is requested to submit a report showing site specific soil percolation test results and design calculations for the proposed soakaway in accordance with BRE Digest 365 Soakaway Design.
  - (2) The applicant is requested to submit a revised drawing showing plan & cross-sectional views, dimensions, and location of the proposed soakaway. Any proposed soakaway shall

# PR/1572/21

## Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

be located fully within the curtilage of the property and shall be:

- (i) At least 5m from any building, public sewer, road boundary or structure.
- (ii) Generally, not within 3m of the boundary of the adjoining property.
- (iii) Not in such a position that the ground below foundations is likely to be adversely affected.
- (iv) 10m from any sewage treatment percolation area and from any watercourse / floodplain.
- (3) The proposed car parking area shall be constructed using a permeable surface such as Permeable Paving, Grass Paving or Porous Asphalt as part of SuDS (Sustainable Drainage System). This shall be included on a revised site plan and submitted to the Planning Authority
- (4) The applicant is requested to submit a cross section detail of the proposed filter drains.

# PR/1572/21

# Record of Executive Business and Chief Executive's Order

REG. REF. SD21B/0530 LOCATION: Oak Lodge, New Road, Clondalkin, Dublin 22, D22F516

Tracy McGibbon,

A/Senior Executive Planner

ORDER: I direct that ADDITIONAL INFORMATION be requested from the applicant as set out in the above report and that notice thereof be served on the applicant.

Eoin Burke, Senior Planner